

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11219

Title: Advances in non-surgical management of primary liver cancer

Reviewer code: 01798669

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-05-09 21:43

Date reviewed: 2014-05-09 22:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a reasonably good review of the topic. However it seems a rather superficial review due to the many topics covered. It may be best to write an in-depth review of one or two non-surgical treatment modalities for HCC, so that the review becomes good reference material for readers.

ESPS Peer-review Report**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 11219**Title:** Advances in non-surgical management of primary liver cancer**Reviewer code:** 00069988**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma**Date sent for review:** 2014-05-09 21:43**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-12 18:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The is important general review of non-surgical therapies for hepatocellular carcinoma. Unfortunately in some parts of the review small studies are used for making conclusions sometimes with to small number of patients or inadequate duration of the follow-up. Some therapies are explained too shortly and therefore complications mentioned at the end cannot be understood because the method is not adequately described. Major changes are needed for the acceptance. The changes needed are put directly to the manuscript word document in red.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11219

Title: Advances in non-surgical management of primary liver cancer

Reviewer code: 00012386

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-05-09 21:43

Date reviewed: 2014-05-13 18:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Chen X et al. reviewed recent advances in non-surgical management of primary liver cancer. This review looks important in this area. In Introduction section, page 3, line 5, “.....Thus, liver cancer possesses a heavy burden for our community.” Is it right?? In Introduction section, page 3, lines 8-10, Authors described “At present, surgery-based comprehensive therapy plays a dominant role in the treatment of HCC. However, the majority of patients had lost their opportunities of surgical treatment when diagnosis was confirmed. Moreover, only 15% patients may benefit from surgical excision.” Authors should add proper reference(s). In Introduction section, page 3, lines 18-19, Authors described “.....Japan Integrated Staging Score (JIS), and Groupe d’ Etude et de Traitement du Carcinoma Heatocellulaire (GRETCH).” Authors should add proper references. In 2.1 PEI section, page 4, Authors should add reference as following: Ebara M, et al. J Gastroenterol Hepatol 1990;5:616-26. And Shiina S, et al. Gastroenterol Jpn 1991;26:47-50. And authors should discuss more with these references. In 2.1 PEI section, page 4, “In this procedure, 95% ethanol is slowly injected.....” Is it right? In 2.2 Radiofrequency ablation section, page 4, Authors should add the important references following: Shiina S et al. Radiofrequency ablation for hepatocellular carcinoma: 10-year outcome and prognostic factors. Am J Gastroenterol. 2012 Apr;107(4):569-77 In 7. Hormonal therapies sections, page 11, Authors described “Sex steroid hormones can interact with the growth receptors and promote the growth of cancer cells. As such, hormonal therapy has been explored as a potential treatment option for many types of solid tumors such as breast cancer, endometrial cancer, and prostate cancer. In HCC, sex hormone receptors, such as estrogen receptor, progesterone receptor and androgen receptor are all expressed [66]......”. Authors should add the following the references



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

and discuss more. Kanda T, et al. Hepatitis C virus core protein augments androgen receptor-mediated signaling. J. Virol. 82: 11066-11072, 2008. Jiang X, et al. Involvement of androgen receptor and glucose-regulated protein 78kDa in human hepatocarcinogenesis. Exp Cell Res 323(2):326-336, 2014.

ESPS Peer-review Report**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 11219**Title:** Advances in non-surgical management of primary liver cancer**Reviewer code:** 00032020**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma**Date sent for review:** 2014-05-09 21:43**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-16 19:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11219 Title: Advances in non-surgical management of primary liver cancer Dr. Xiao Chen, et al. Major: This is a comprehensive review about HCC therapy, including new approaches. I hope that the below points will be revised. In the Introduction, authors should also refer the papers about the left two staging systems; Japan Integrated Staging Score, and Group d' Etude et de Traitement du Carcinoma Hepatocellulaire. In the session of RFA, the below paper should be referred in the addition to the reference 11. A randomized controlled trial of radiofrequency ablation with ethanol injection for small hepatocellular carcinoma. Shiina S, Teratani T, Obi S, Sato S, Tateishi R, Fujishima T, Ishikawa T, Koike Y, Yoshida H, Kawabe T, Omata M. Gastroenterology. 2005 Jul;129(1):122-30. In the session of Radiotherapy, authors had better add the comment about Proton beam therapy, with some references.