

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 10195

**Title:** Alimentary regimen in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease: the Mediterranean diet

**Reviewer code:** 00039434

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-19 10:01

**Date reviewed:** 2014-03-24 01:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study the authors evaluated the literature data on the effectiveness of the Mediterranean diet in reducing cardiovascular risk and in preventing major chronic diseases, including obesity and diabetes. The paper is well structured.

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 10195

**Title:** Alimentary regimen in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease: the Mediterranean diet

**Reviewer code:** 02079515

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-19 10:01

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-16 15:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review is interesting. However, recently it has been suggested that lower body iron stores induced by dietary components of Mediterranean diet could be involved in the beneficial action of this dietary pattern in NAFLD. Mounting evidence suggests a link between serum ferritin, insulin resistance, and NAFLD. Body iron excess has frequently been found in patients with metabolic syndrome, with serum ferritin showing a linear increase with the increasing number of metabolic syndrome features. Moreover, it has been suggested that the relation between serum ferritin and most of metabolic syndrome features might be mediated by the presence of NAFLD at population-based level. Excessive hepatic iron accumulation in NAFLD can be one of the potential cofactors involved in the enhanced oxidative stress, which triggers liver cell necrosis and activation of hepatic stellate cells, both leading to fibrosis. On the other hand, it has been proposed that the balance between the average bioavailability of dietary iron and the overall effects of inhibitors and enhancers of iron absorption may lead to lower iron stores in people consuming a Mediterranean dietary pattern. In fact, it has been reported that elderly men from Crete, in the Mediterranean south of Europe had consistently lower levels of indicators of oxidative stress and iron status than elderly men from Zutphen in the north of Europe. In particular, serum ferritin, a good marker of the iron stored in the body, were 2-fold lower in men from Crete than in men from Zutphen (69.8 lg/L and 134.2 lg/L, respectively). SUGGESTED REFERENCES Mascitelli L, Goldstein MR. Mediterranean diet, lower body iron stores and metabolic syndrome. Int J Clin Pract 2011;65:1110.



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

Buijsse B, Feskens EJ, Moschandreas J, Jansen EH, Jacobs Jr DR, Kafatos A, et al. Oxidative stress, and iron and antioxidant status in elderly men: differences between the Mediterranean south (Crete) and northern Europe (Zutphen). *Eur J Cardiovasc Prev Rehabil* 2007;14:495–500. Trombini P, Piperno A. Ferritin, metabolic syndrome and NAFLD: elective attractions and dangerous liaisons. *J Hepatol* 2007;46:549–552. Bozzini C, Girelli D, Olivieri O, Martinelli N, Bassi A, De Matteis G, et al. Prevalence of body iron excess in the metabolic syndrome. *Diabetes Care* 2005;28:2061–2063. Zelber-Sagi S, Nitzan-Kaluski D, Halpern Z, Oren R. NAFLD and hyperinsulinemia are major determinants of serum ferritin levels. *J Hepatol* 2007;46:700–707. George DK, Goldwurm S, MacDonald GA, Cowley LL, Walker NI, Ward PJ, et al. Increased hepatic iron concentration in non-alcoholic steatohepatitis is associated with increased fibrosis. *Gastroenterology* 1998;114:311–318. Mascitelli L, Goldstein MR. Might some of the beneficial effects of the Mediterranean diet on non-alcoholic fatty liver disease be mediated by reduced iron stores? *J Hepatol*. 2013;59:639.

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 10195

**Title:** Alimentary regimen in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease: the Mediterranean diet

**Reviewer code:** 02860898

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-19 10:01

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-29 08:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is well structured and covers a main topic in the research of cardiovascular risk and chronic disease related with obesity and diabetes. The review is well structured but it has some minor language polishing.

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 10195

**Title:** Alimentary regimen in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease: the Mediterranean diet

**Reviewer code:** 01412711

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-19 10:01

**Date reviewed:** 2014-06-19 06:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors describe in detail the pathophysiology of NAFLD and the benefits of the Mediterranean diet. They attempt to link the two. While the background material is very well written, it provides minimal novelty. The core of this review should be the effect of this diet on NAFLD. The only large scale controlled study referenced (Shai et al) showed a surrogate of NAFLD (alt) and did not actually quantify steatosis. Other studies are either small or none-controlled thus it is difficult to draw conclusions from them. The authors do not convince the reader with data regarding the benefits of this diet in comparison to any other low calorie diet that can achieve the quoted weight loss targets.

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 10195

**Title:** Alimentary regimen in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease: the Mediterranean diet

**Reviewer code:** 02903629

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-19 10:01

**Date reviewed:** 2014-06-26 22:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I wonder why the author does not show some prevalence data of NAFLD (only Italy) in the Mediterranean region. As we all known, there are different diet patterns around the world. This paper repeatedly stress the key role of Mediterranean diet in the prevention and the treatment of NAFLD. However, according to the recent meta-analysis, the prevalence of NAFLD in China (typical oriental dietary pattern) is about 20.1%, which is lower than that of Italy (25%). More data (developing countries) are needed in the Introduction section. My suggestion is that different diet patterns should be compared to highlights the importance of Mediterranean diet.

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 10195

**Title:** Alimentary regimen in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease: the Mediterranean diet

**Reviewer code:** 00013203

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-19 10:01

**Date reviewed:** 2014-07-06 06:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript Title: Alimentary regimen in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease: Mediterranean diet  
 Manuscript No: 10195 This a nice review on the role of Mediterranean diet regimen in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease. I have a few comments for authors. Page 5. Introduction section. At the present form is too long Page 5. Introduction section. Important references are missing: Kontogianni MD1, Tileli N2, Margariti A3, Georgoulis M4, Deutsch M5, Tiniakos D6, Fragopoulou E7, Zafiropoulou R8, Manios Y9, Papatheodoridis G10. Adherence to the Mediterranean diet is associated with the severity of non-alcoholic fatty liver disease. Clin Nutr. 2014 Aug;33(4):678-83. doi: 10.1016/j.clnu.2013.08.014. Epub 2013 Sep 7. Trovato FM1, Catalano D1, Martines GF1, Pace P1, Trovato GM2. Mediterranean diet and non-alcoholic fatty liver disease.: The need of extended and comprehensive interventions. Clin Nutr. 2014 Jan 31. pii: S0261-5614(14)00043-0. doi: 10.1016/j.clnu.2014.01.018. [Epub ahead of print] Pages 28 and 29. Figures 1 and 2. The legends of these figures are incomplete. The authors need to write them in a more detailed form. I suggest to design a table with a list of main studies on Mediterranean diet in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease. Analyzing the results of metabolic variables A list of abbreviations is mandatory