

ESPS Peer-review Report**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 11130**Title:** Efficacy and Safety of Herbal Medicines in Treating Gastric Ulcer**Reviewer code:** 00504545**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma**Date sent for review:** 2014-05-06 21:31**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-12 01:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In my opinion it is an excellent review about the role and efficacy of the herbal medicines in treating ulcer gastric patients

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11130

Title: Efficacy and Safety of Herbal Medicines in Treating Gastric Ulcer

Reviewer code: 00032528

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-05-06 21:31

Date reviewed: 2014-05-13 11:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General: Authors reviewed efficacy and safety of Herbal medicines for treatment of gastric ulcer. Authors concluded that utilization of herbal medicines could be a valuable alternative to effectively treat gastric ulcer with fewer adverse effects in humans. Recently, herbal medicines are focused for efficacy and safety for treatment with any kinds of diseases, especially in physicians outside China. Therefore, this review article may have potential to increase knowledge for treatment of gastric ulcer. Although this trial is interesting, paper seems to have any problems. Major comments: 1. It is hard to understand information about mechanism in Table 1. Please make scheme summarized biological mechanisms of cure by Herbal medicines for treatment of gastric ulcer. 2. Authors commented cost effectiveness in Introduction. Do herbal medicines have cost effectiveness in patients with gastric ulcer? If you have no data, it will be better to delete these comments. 3. It is unclear what herbal medicines are best to treat gastric ulcer. Authors mention many kinds of herbal medicine in this review study. 4. Recently, first-line therapy for gastric ulcer is PPI. Please compare efficacy with PPI and herbal medicines. 5. Which treatment do authors recommend in patients with gastric ulcer. Herbal medicines alone? Concomitant therapy with herbal medicine and PPI? 6. Most of patients with gastric ulcer have H. pylori infection. Therefore, authors should add comments about relationship with H. pylori infection and herbal medicines more. 7. Ref 67 is not appropriate. In general, recurrence rate of gastric ulcer during PPI treatment is not so high. 8. How about effect of herbal medicines for H. pylori eradication therapy?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11130

Title: Efficacy and Safety of Herbal Medicines in Treating Gastric Ulcer

Reviewer code: 00050109

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-05-06 21:31

Date reviewed: 2014-05-17 13:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Reviewer comments Authors did attempt to address an important issue. Feel can be better if they taken into considerations of the following issues: This is a review article. But in the title it has not been mentioned about the type of the article. Some of the references are on peptic ulcer diseases. In the introduction, the authors have stress on the side effects of the allopathic medicines (H2 blockers, Proton pump inhibitors and PG analogs) routinely used for the treatment of gastric ulcer and given reference no 13 and 14 against this statement. But both of these articles talk about the pharmacology of H2 blockers and the incidence of side effects are 2-3% and no irreversible side effects are known with these group of drugs. So the side effects profile of these drugs are mild in nature and tolerable. The limitations of use of herbal medicines are: More than one active ingredients are commonly present in any herbal product Some of the active ingredients may be poisonous Significant drug herb interactions have been documented in the literatures Long term safety of these compounds are still not known Well designed RCTs are lacking with majority of herbal medicines In the conclusion the authors have mention that "Thus, herbal medicines alone or in combination with conventional drugs could be used as optional alternative for treating certain gastric ulcer and preventing recurrence". While considering the above mentioned limitations of the herbal medicine, this statement can not be justified. In the title of the table 1 there is a mistake "mechanisma" Title of the tables are not self explanatory. In the table 2, define cure rate and effective rate, define the patients characteristics and diagnosis etc. References are not according to the journal's pattern. Regarding the mechanisms of the herbal medicines as an anti gastric ulcer agent is not very clear. Should discussed in details with evidences.