

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8782

Title: Correlation between Hepatic Blood Flow and liver Function In Alcoholic Liver Cirrhosis

Reviewer code: 02861276

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2014-01-09 21:39

Date reviewed: 2014-01-20 22:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. It is uncertain that whether the patients with other diseases for these 35 patients with AL-LC. 2. In some cases the differences between groups do not look compelling. Can more detail be provided of which method that was used

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8782

Title: Correlation between Hepatic Blood Flow and liver Function In Alcoholic Liver Cirrhosis

Reviewer code: 02520050

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2014-01-09 21:39

Date reviewed: 2014-01-21 01:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is a pleasure to review manuscript NO 8782 entitled "Correlation between Hepatic Blood Flow and liver Function In Alcoholic Liver Cirrhosis" by Takahashi, et al. The study is an interesting exploration of how hepatic perfusion may relate to liver function. My comments: 1. I think the manuscript should be reviewed and edited by a native English speaker, as this would help the ease of comprehension for the reader. 2. A significant conclusion would include how this correlation between blood flow and liver function is clinically useful. For example, should we stop getting blood tests, and use liver imaging instead? There is essentially no discussion of how this could be applied clinically, which I think is critical. 3. The title suggests the paper is about blood flow, and Xe-CT imaging is a large part of the methodology, yet the results really suggest that ICG-R15 correlates with liver function much more so than imaging. And ICG-R15 really doesn't relate to blood flow measurement—the title/theme and results seem disjointed. Should the paper really be more focused on ICG-R15? 4. I would consolidate or eliminate figures 6 and 7 – there are too many plots, and the data could be summarized more succinctly.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8782

Title: Correlation between Hepatic Blood Flow and liver Function In Alcoholic Liver Cirrhosis

Reviewer code: 02439020

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2014-01-09 21:39

Date reviewed: 2014-01-22 22:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title: Correlation between Hepatic Blood Flow and liver Function In Alcoholic Liver Cirrhosis.

Reviewer's code: 02439020 Date sent for review: 2014-01-09 Date reviewed: 2014-01-22 Dear Dr.

Hideaki Takahashi, This is an interesting manuscript dealing with Correlation between Hepatic Blood Flow and liver Function in Alcoholic Liver Cirrhosis by Hideaki Takahashi et al. This paper is relevant and well presented for publication in WJG. However, the following major points must be answered before publication: 1. There is no explanation on the importance of this study. This should be explained more thoroughly. 2. Authors should pay attention to the uppercase in the title. 3. There is a lack of necessary description in the results section. 4. In the fifth paragraph of discussion section, I consider some description to be confusing and irrelevant. 5. References are too old, 80's and before account for 1/3 of the references. 6. There're some grammar and spelling mistakes and the manuscript contains some unclear abbreviation (e.g. EGV, IMV, silmutaneously etc.). 7. The purpose of the study was not illustrated clearly. The author mentioned about the relationship between liver function, liver diseases status and hepatic blood flow (HBF), but the conclusion included only the correlation between PVTBF, ICG R15 and liver function. Hence, I suggest that the authors revise the manuscript to see if there is significant close correlation between HBF, liver function and maybe furthermore liver diseases status. And it is not sufficient to use Alcoholic Liver Cirrhosis only, thus a control group is needed at least. Thanks for submitting your manuscript to World Journal of Gastroenterology.