



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

### ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 11356

**Title:** Clostridium difficile infection aggravates colitis in IL-10 deficient mice.

**Reviewer code:** 00030205

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-05-17 17:49

**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-27 03:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting study with new insight in to inflammtion related to clostridium d. Some aspects need revision. 1. The sample size is small and non-parmateric statistics should be used. 2. The characteristics of the mice groups need to be described in the methods and not only in the figures. 3. The relevance for clinical IBD managemnt need a thorough discussion.

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 11356

**Title:** Clostridium difficile infection aggravates colitis in IL-10 deficient mice.

**Reviewer code:** 01434943

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-05-17 17:49

**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-28 13:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

# COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a relatively straight forward experimental study describing an exacerbation of colitis by C difficile. Attention to English grammar is required throughout the manuscript. Readability requires improvement. Specific comments follow: **TITLE:** Concise and descriptive. **ABSTRACT:** Are the values mean +/-SD or SEM?. This should be stated. The Results section has several grammatical errors. **CORE TIP:** Appropriate apart from grammar. **INTRODUCTION:** A succinct summary of the work. **METHODS:** Well described and appropriate. **RESULTS:** Why were the cytokine studies confined to IFN-g, IL-12 and IL-23?. Further justification is required. The 4 lines in figure 3 are difficult to discriminate. 2 dotted lines (eg for IL-10KO) should be used. Was the histology scoring blinded?. IFN-g expression in figure 6 is strange. There is virtually no variation in 6B but huge variation in 6A and even more in 6C. Why is this so?. Were there outliers?. **DISCUSSION:** A good description. Some discussion of other compounds that exacerbate experimental colitis is warranted. For example, Geier found that the prebiotic FOS also tended to exacerbate experimental colitis. **REFERENCES:** Appropriate

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 11356

**Title:** Clostridium difficile infection aggravates colitis in IL-10 deficient mice.

**Reviewer code:** 01441415

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-05-17 17:49

**Date reviewed:** 2014-06-08 18:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

# COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to the authors This manuscript by Kim et al. reported a novel model of C difficile infection in IL-10<sup>-/-</sup> mice as an IBD-like model. This model has considerable potentials to explore the pathophysiological role of C difficile infection in human IBD, the underlying mechanism and following therapeutic directions. However, this manuscript involves several concerns to be dissolved before acceptance for publication. Although the authors used IL-10<sup>-/-</sup> mice to mimic human IBD in this study, histological assessments in Fig. 5 and 6 revealed no derangements compared with WT mice without C difficile infection. It is strongly recommended to mention the solid rationale why the authors selected IL-10<sup>-/-</sup> mice, among several IBD animal models, in this study. In the comparison group of Figure 6C, "WT" should be "WT + C. difficile", right? The statistical analysis was performed in the assessments of body weight change in Figure 3? The figure presented the change ratio, is there any difference in baseline body weight between WT and IL-10<sup>-/-</sup> mice? The authors suggest that C difficile infection has pivotal role for continuous aggravation of IBD. In Fig. 3, regardless of genetic backgrounds, body weight has recovered to the levels of control groups. This recovery implies that the aggravation of intestinal inflammation induced by C difficile infection is just acute phenomenon, but chronic. How the authors interpret the data?