



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11356

Title: Clostridium difficile infection aggravates colitis in IL-10 deficient mice.

Reviewer code: 00030205

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-05-17 17:49

Date reviewed: 2014-05-27 03:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting study with new insight in to inflammmtion related to clostridium d. Some aspects need revision. 1. The sample size is small and non-parmateric statistics should be used. 2. The characteristics of the mice groups need to be described in the methods and not only in the figures. 3. The relevance for clinical IBD managemnt need a thorough discussion.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11356

Title: Clostridium difficile infection aggravates colitis in IL-10 deficient mice.

Reviewer code: 01434943

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-05-17 17:49

Date reviewed: 2014-05-28 13:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a relatively straight forward experimental study describing an exacerbation of colitis by C difficile. Attention to English grammar is required throughout the manuscript. Readability requires improvement. Specific comments follow: **TITLE:** Concise and descriptive. **ABSTRACT:** Are the values mean +/-SD or SEM?. This should be stated. The Results section has several grammatical errors. **CORE TIP:** Appropriate apart from grammar. **INTRODUCTION:** A succinct summary of the work. **METHODS:** Well described and appropriate. **RESULTS:** Why were the cytokine studies confined to IFN-g, IL-12 and IL-23?. Further justification is required. The 4 lines in figure 3 are difficult to discriminate. 2 dotted lines (eg for IL-10KO) should be used. Was the histology scoring blinded?.IFN-g expression in figure 6 is strange. There is virtually no variation in 6B but huge variation in 6A and even more in 6C. Why is this so?. Were there outliers?. **DISCUSSION:** A good description. Some discussion of other compounds that exacerbate experimental colitis is warranted. For example, Geier found that the prebiotic FOS also tended to exacerbate experimental colitis. **REFERENCES:** Appropriate



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11356

Title: Clostridium difficile infection aggravates colitis in IL-10 deficient mice.

Reviewer code: 01441415

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-05-17 17:49

Date reviewed: 2014-06-08 18:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to the authors This manuscript by Kim et al. reported a novel model of C difficile infection in IL-10^{-/-} mice as an IBD-like model. This model has considerable potentials to explore the pathophysiological role of C difficile infection in human IBD, the underlying mechanism and following therapeutic directions. However, this manuscript involves several concerns to be dissolved before acceptance for publication. Although the authors used IL-10^{-/-} mice to mimic human IBD in this study, histological assessments in Fig. 5 and 6 revealed no derangements compared with WT mice without C difficile infection. It is strongly recommended to mention the solid rationale why the authors selected IL-10^{-/-} mice, among several IBD animal models, in this study. In the comparison group of Figure 6C, "WT" should be "WT + C. difficile", right? The statistical analysis was performed in the assessments of body weight change in Figure 3? The figure presented the change ratio, is there any difference in baseline body weight between WT and IL-10^{-/-} mice? The authors suggest that C difficile infection has pivotal role for continuous aggravation of IBD. In Fig. 3, regardless of genetic backgrounds, body weight has recovered to the levels of control groups. This recovery implies that the aggravation of intestinal inflammation induced by C difficile infection is just acute phenomenon, but chronic. How the authors interpret the data?