

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11374

Title: Clinical epidemiology of Ulcerative Colitis in Arabs based on Montréal classification

Reviewer code: 00058440

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-05-19 20:10

Date reviewed: 2014-05-23 09:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper addresses the clinical, epidemiological and phenotypic characteristics of UC in Saudi Arabia, by studying the largest cohort of Arab UC patients and concluded that prevalence of UC seems to be increasing in Saudi Arabia, and the majority of UC cases are diagnosed in young people (17–40 years) with a male preponderance. The authors also pointed out that while the disease course was found to be similar to that reported in Western countries, more similarities were found with Asian countries with regards to the extent of the disease, and response to steroid therapy. I do have some comments as listed below in the order noted. Comment 1: The quality of the data set is very important, especially in a population-based registry. For this reason, please clarify the excluded criteria in the Materials and Methods section. Comment2: In Tables 1-2, the authors provided the 95% C.I. I believe it should be the Range (from minimum to maximum). Please clarify. Comment3: The authors addressed the odds ratio (OR) and 95% confidence interval (CI) were used in the Statistical Analysis, but we could not identify these values in the Tables and Figures. Please clarify it. Comment4: In Figure 1, the authors provided the relation between age and incidence of UC. Please define and clarify the incidence rate here.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11374

Title: Clinical epidemiology of Ulcerative Colitis in Arabs based on Montréal classification

Reviewer code: 00068278

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-05-19 20:10

Date reviewed: 2014-05-27 01:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the presented paper the authors aimed to determine the clinical, epidemiological and phenotypic characteristics of ulcerative colitis (UC) in Saudi Arabia, by studying the largest cohort of Arab UC patients, between September 2009 and September 2013. They found some similarities and differences between their patients and patients from Asian and Western countries. My comments are; 1-There are many discrepancies throughout the manuscript including the text and tables. a-Abstract, results: The ratio of patients with only proctitis must be 22%, not 29.2%. b-Results: Disease characteristics; The ratio of patients with only proctitis must be 22%, not 29.2%. c- Page 9, last paragraph; "Among our patients, 77.0% (95% CI: 73.0-82.0) had infrequent relapse; 17.4% (95% CI: 13.3-21.5) had frequent relapse; and 4.8% (95% CI: 2.4-7.1) had chronic disease with no remission." The percentages are different from those in Table 1. d- Page 10, Treatment and response, 3. sentence; Additionally, 85.2% (95% CI: 78.9-91.4) were steroid responsive, 7.0% (95% CI: 2.5-11.5) were steroid dependent, and 6.2% (95% CI: 2.0-10.5) did not respond to steroid treatment. (Total 98.4%. What about the remainig 1.6% of the patients?) e- Page 10, Extraintestinal manifestations: Discrepancies between Table 3 and results: With regard to extraintestinal manifestations, arthritis was present in 16.4% (95% CI: 10.4-22.0) of the patients (no information in Table 3), osteopenia in 31.4% (95% CI: 22.4-40.4) (30.5% in Table 3), and osteoporosis in 17.1% (95% CI: 9.8-24.4). Primary sclerosing cholangitis was found in 0.8% (0.9%?) of the patients, and deep vein thrombosis (DVT) was found in 2.1% (1.9%?), one of whom had a fatal pulmonary embolism during hospitalization. Cutaneous involvement was observed in 7% of our population: majority of these patients had an unspecific skin rash, while in 25% (23.8%?) of them had erythema nodosum. 2-In Abstract, Conclusion; Without giving any information



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

in results it is not appropriate to say that majority of the cases are diagnosed in young people. 3-Page 11, last paragraph, 6.sentence: Sir Lanka must be written as "Sri Lanka". 4-What are the definitions of osteopenia and osteoporosis? The definitions should be given in materials and methods. 5-Page 12, last sentence: It is written that "...these findings are also similar to those in our population (85.5% responded and 14% did not respond)." But, in "Treatment and response" section it was stated that "Additionally, 85.2% (95% CI: 78.9-91.4) were steroid responsive, 7.0% (95% CI: 2.5-11.5) were steroid dependent, and 6.2% (95% CI: 2.0-10.5) did not respond to steroid treatment." The steroid dependent and steroid nonresponsive patients were accepted as nonresponsive. 6-References are not written according to the Journal's instructions.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11374

Title: Clinical epidemiology of Ulcerative Colitis in Arabs based on Montréal classification

Reviewer code: 00058696

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-05-19 20:10

Date reviewed: 2014-06-06 04:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

MAJOR QUESTION: The authors' findings are quite distinct from clinical features of ulcerative colitis reported from the United States. Do the authors believe that there is an infectious component contributing to colitis seen in Saudi Arabia? **MINOR ISSUES:** Page 6, line 17: Add "of" between "All" and "these". Page 7, line 6: How was it decided that 10% of the data in the registry was randomly checked? Where did the number 10% come from? Page 8, line 3: Change spelling of "ilium" to "ileum". Page 8, line 2-6: This is not a complete sentence, consider rewriting. Page 12, line 6: Capitalize North America. Page 13, line 5-6: The second half of this sentence is unclear. Consider rewriting.