

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11655

Title: Helicobacter pylori infection and atopic diseases: is there a relationship? A systematic review and meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 00503623

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-05-29 23:48

Date reviewed: 2014-06-09 23:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The MS 11655 provides critical review of the literature on the relationship between Hp atopy and allergic diseases. The conclusion supports the well entrenched concept that childhood infections (not only wit Hp) may be necessary to induce the proper maturation of the immune system. There are several points that require your additional attention; 1. The author quotation by name should be followed in each case by the number, and this is not the case here. 2. The country of the university hospital on p.18 should be listed, otherwise to most readers this is a big unknown. 3. The Hp signaling through TLR4 requires some additional elaboration and referencing(see Inflammopharmacology 21(2013)67-78 and vol.22(2014) 169-177).

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11655

Title: Helicobacter pylori infection and atopic diseases: is there a relationship? A systematic review and meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 00039368

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-05-29 23:48

Date reviewed: 2014-06-10 19:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very well written systematic review and meta-analysis paper concerning the relationship between Helicobacter pylori infection and atopic diseases. The authors give the extensive overview about the present outlook of the hygiene hypothesis, about the possible inverse association of H. pylori infection with allergic diseases. The authors present detailed description of host immune response by H. pylori infection. A very accurate analysis of the case-control as well as cross-sectional studies give a good overview about the evidences pro and contra the relationship between allergy and H. pylori infection which prevalence show the tendency to reduction with increasing prevalence of atopic diseases in developed and industrialized countries. The authors have reviewed and analyzed an ample amount of literature (59 references). The review is supplied with 2 Tables and 6 figures. However, the following points needs to be considered: 1. In the list of References are absent two references cited on the p. 5: no 19 and no 20. 2. The abbreviation of Hepatitis A virus (HAV) appears at the first time on the p.14, but is used already on p. 11. 3. In all presented Figures (Fig. 1 to Fig. 6) the authors use the abbreviation TB+ and TB-. For me it is not clear what does it mean? Should it be H. pylori + and H. pylori -?

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11655

Title: Helicobacter pylori infection and atopic diseases: is there a relationship? A systematic review and meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 00036328

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-05-29 23:48

Date reviewed: 2014-06-13 07:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study titled 'Helicobacter pylori infection and atopic diseases: is there a relationship? A systematic review and meta-analysis' from Lionetti E and co. is an interesting review about the relationship between Hp infection and atopy/atopic diseases. A meta-analysis of data is also showed in the text. My comments are listed below. On page 5, line 19 it is stated that 'phylogeographic studies assume that the ancestors of the bacteria have begun to populate the human stomach 4 million years ago'(ref. #16). In the paper of Bodo Linz et al. I have not find this information. Moreover, references jump from 18 to 21 making difficult to follow the citations. Six meta-analyses were conducted on the cited literature that suggest the inverse relationship between Hp infection and atopic diseases. The description of the tables is not straightforward. For example, it is not clear that cases are the subjects with atopy/allergic diseases and that TB+ are those with Hp infection. I am really surprised that the meta-analyses were performed without any indication about the method or the software used. To perform a meta-analysis there are many points that must be monitored and described in detail. For example, how were the criteria used for considering studies for this review? How was the search strategy for identification of studies? What about data extraction? Study quality? How was the statistical method used? How was measured the heterogeneity? Without these indications everyone may construct a meta-analysis without any scientific value.