

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11947

Title: Per Oral Endoscopy Myotomy: NOTES here and now

Reviewer code: 00503955

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-06-13 18:01

Date reviewed: 2014-06-23 20:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A nice review article evaluating the efficiency of peroral endoscopic myotomy (POEM) and adjunctive techniques with due regard to controversies of this procedure.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11947

Title: Per Oral Endoscopy Myotomy: NOTES here and now

Reviewer code: 02486710

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-06-13 18:01

Date reviewed: 2014-06-23 21:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors presented a nice view on peroral endoscopic myotomy (POEM) with their initial experience but the problems start at the title. Since NOTES is a technique requiring transluminal intervention, POEM has no transluminal step. In NOTES, you should perform the operation by passing the wall of the luminal organ. POEM should not be classified as a technique under NOTES procedure. I recommend you to work with an expert surgery experienced on minimally invasive surgery. Secondly, you should mention about achalasia in your title since main focus of your paper on this disease. Since you have no page numbers, I could not point more precisely my concerns. In abstract, "incision free" should be well defined. POEM itself is a surgical intervention and you made a myotomy to treat the disease. So I understand "incision free" as non scar surgical procedure, please clarify this. POEM procedure can be a good alternative to conventional laparoscopic or open surgery. Please do not offer POEM as an alternative to surgery, since it is a surgical operation itself. Please be specific to your main topic rather arguing about oncological minimally invasive approaches. There is no surgical intervention which eliminates surveillance requirement for any GI cancer after single application. Conclusion should be more realistic. You may say POEM has the potential to be the preferred modality for achalasia.... Thx