

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10537

Title: Cancer-associated fibroblasts in digestive tumors

Reviewer code: 00292853

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-04-06 18:25

Date reviewed: 2014-04-17 18:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review would markedly benefit from the incorporation of tables and figures. For example, a figure with a typical histology showing both tumor cells and CAFs could be shown; and a figure showing the interplay between CAFs with tumor cells and some of the major molecules involved in this interaction that are mentioned throughout the text could be shown. In addition, the origin of those molecules either derived from tumor cells or CAFs can be illustrated. A figure showing CAFs and their different roles in EMT, prognosis, chemoresistance, immunity, progression, therapy etc. with some of the molecules involved could be designed. Unfortunately, a last paragraph entitled like "Conclusions and future work" or something like that is missing. Such an outlook is needed. There is evidence that the intra-tumor stroma percentage in cancers can serve as prognostic marker, (e.g. A. Huijbers, R.A. Tollenaar, G.W. v Pelt, E.C. Zeestraten, S. Dutton, C.C. McConkey et al. The proportion of tumor-stroma as a strong prognosticator for stage II and III colon cancer patients: validation in the VICTOR trial. Ann Oncol, 24 (2013), pp. 179-185.) This should be incorporated into the respective section on CAFs and prognosis. p.8: the correct name of the first author of ref. 42 is Olumi. The authors should add a few sentences about differences/similarities of CAFs in primary tumors versus CAFs in the corresponding metastases. Are there differences?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10537

Title: Cancer-associated fibroblasts in digestive tumors

Reviewer code: 02446368

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-04-06 18:25

Date reviewed: 2014-04-19 23:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting paper.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10537

Title: Cancer-associated fibroblasts in digestive tumors

Reviewer code: 01333103

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-04-06 18:25

Date reviewed: 2014-04-23 20:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review reported a broad explanation of CAFs and their role in tumor microenvironment. The review is well written and highlights a topic of great scientific interest. I suggest some minor modifications.

1. The title is perhaps not appropriate because the manuscript is not only about the role of CAFs in digestive tumors, but also in other tumors. Otherwise, we recommend to improve the review with a final paragraph specifically devoted to underline the role of CAFs in digestive tumors only.
3. In the paragraph CAFs and EMT, it is necessary to better explain the role of CAFs in EMT process using more recent reports (i.e., Yu Y, Xiao CH et al. Br J Cancer. 2014 Feb 4;110(3):724-32).
4. More generally, we recommend to review the bibliography using more updated references.
5. Errors have been detected in some of the abbreviations (i.e., the double allocation for LPA abbreviation: at page 6 the authors indicate LPA as abbreviation of the lysophosphatidic acid and subsequently at page 7 as abbreviation of lysophosphatidic acid). HGF is present only as abbreviation.