



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10525

Title: Protective effect of terminal ileostomy on bacterial translocation in a rat model of intestinal ischemia/reperfusion injury

Reviewer code: 01569271

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-04-06 18:50

Date reviewed: 2014-04-13 23:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A thorough study with an interesting hypothesis but as rightly pointed out the Quantification and incidence of CIR needs to be established before it can be thought of as a possible cause.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10525

Title: Protective effect of terminal ileostomy on bacterial translocation in a rat model of intestinal ischemia/reperfusion injury

Reviewer code: 00503518

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-04-06 18:50

Date reviewed: 2014-05-27 14:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The results are very interesting. However, involvement of CIR in this model should be more clearly indicated.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10525

Title: Protective effect of terminal ileostomy on bacterial translocation in a rat model of intestinal ischemia/reperfusion injury

Reviewer code: 01552211

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-04-06 18:50

Date reviewed: 2014-05-29 23:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

GENERAL COMMENTS The possibility to avoid colonization of terminal ileum with colonic flora seems to be an important mechanism to prevent bacterial translocation and multi-organ dysfunction in the ischemia-reperfusion model. The study of Zhiliang Lin and coworkers clearly shows how ileostomy may contribute in preventing the detrimental effects of ligation of superior mesenteric artery. The paper is well designed, the conclusions are supported by specific data, and its length and bibliography are appropriate. However, there are a number of issues that should be improved.

SPECIFIC COMMENTS Title & Abstract: they accurately reflects the major topic and contents of the study. Materials and methods: A figure should be inserted in order to better clarify the different surgical interventions, thus allowing the reader to follow the consequences of these different conditions. The method used to detect cytokine concentrations must be specified (ELISA?). Results: the data are simply and clearly presented. Discussion: The section is well organised. However, a note of caution in emphasizing the ileal clearing effect should be inserted, since theoretically the ileostomy does not affect the motility pattern of the gut and additional mechanisms may contribute in its efficacy. On the other side, whether the clearing capacity of the terminal ileum would be preserved, it should be able to counteract the CIR. References: the references are appropriate and updated. Mistakes: there are many mistakes that must be corrected such as: - In the title page, the words 'ischemia' and 'methods' are written in a wrong manner and 'systematic' has a different meaning in comparison to 'systemic'; - In the introduction section, the term 'topical' is hard to understand and the following sentence is non-sense "but seldom has studies attached importance to the reflux of



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

intestinal bacteria"; - In the Operative Procedure paragraph, the term 'breathe' must be corrected; -

In the Histopathology paragraph, the words 'vill', 'examed', and 'atrophty' are wrong.

LANGUAGE EVALUATION: the English language is slightly defective, and a full revision from a mother tongue speaker is requested. In addition, there are a number of typos in the manuscript that must be corrected. Some specific mistakes are present many time.