

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10536

Title: 2014-4-5 Lean_NAFLD

Reviewer code: 00159298

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-04-06 18:30

Date reviewed: 2014-04-07 03:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Authors, this is a well-planned study tackling a very updated issue. However, the discussion seems to totally exclude the recent data on the gut milieu interplay. Before accepting this paper, I would strongly advice to include some discussion on this issue and with references such as: Goel A, Gupta M, Aggarwal R. Gut microbiota and liver disease. J Gastroenterol Hepatol. 2014 Ritze Y, Bárdos G, Claus A, Ehrmann V, Bergheim I, Schwartz A, Bischoff SC. Lactobacillus rhamnosus GG Protects against Non-Alcoholic Fatty Liver Disease in Mice. PLoS One. 2014 Del Chierico F, Gnani D, Vernocchi P, Petrucca A, Alisi A, Dallapiccola B, Nobili V, Lorenza P. Meta-omic platforms to assist in the understanding of NAFLD gut microbiota alterations: tools and applications. Int J Mol Sci. 2014 Jan 7;15(1):684-711 Not less important is to envisage potential interventions by mentioning all these 3 references which are of great interest: Tomaro-Duchesneau C, Saha S, Malhotra M, Jones ML, Labbé A, Rodes L, Kahouli I, Prakash S. Effect of orally administered L. fermentum NCIMB 5221 on markers of metabolic syndrome: an in vivo analysis using ZDF rats. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol. 2014 Jan;98(1):115-26. Bhathena J, Martoni C, Kulamarva A, Tomaro-Duchesneau C, Malhotra M, Paul A, Urbanska AM, Prakash S. Oral probiotic microcapsule formulation ameliorates non-alcoholic fatty liver disease in Bio F1B Golden Syrian hamsters. PLoS One. 2013;8(3):e58394. Urbanska AM, Bhathena J, Prakash S. Live encapsulated Lactobacillus acidophilus cells in yogurt for therapeutic oral delivery: preparation and in vitro analysis of alginate-chitosan microcapsules. Can J Physiol Pharmacol. 2007 Sep;85(9):884-93

ESPS Peer-review Report**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10536**Title:** 2014-4-5 Lean_NAFLD**Reviewer code:** 02538244**Science editor:** Yuan Qi**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-06 18:30**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-21 08:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors provided a detailed survey to study the prevalence and disorders of metabolism and blood cell examination in Lean-non-alcoholic fatty liver disease (Lean-NAFLD). The results of their comparative analysis are clearly presented and provide, perhaps for the first time a survey in local district, but also the epidemic limitation due to sampling bias. One of the noticeable results of their study is that subjects in normal weight NAFLD subjects are more likely to diabetes, hypertension and MetS. The authors have proposed the estimate prevalence rate for Lean-NAFLD, and its own metabolic characteristics different from Overweight-obese patients. Lean-NAFLD group has lower blood glucose, blood pressure, hyperlipidemia, IR, blood cell count and HGB than Overweight-obese NAFLD. However, in reviewer opinion, it is clear that the results obtained herein worth further be mined to gain the insight of the most important characteristics of NAFLD. Prediction and validation steps might offer the feasible biological application. Overall, this paper presents a timely and useful survey of Lean-NAFLD features based on the available clinical parameters.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10536

Title: 2014-4-5 Lean_NAFLD

Reviewer code: 02531679

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-04-06 18:30

Date reviewed: 2014-04-29 03:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The data in this work only repeats what is already well known and even in other Chinese and other Oriental population. Major part of the discussion is not relevant to the work itself.