

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5934

Title: Therapy with Stem Cell in Inflammatory Bowel Disease (IBD).

Reviewer code: 01490296

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 11:33

Date reviewed: 2013-10-05 02:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors compiled a thorough review. In general, the review is informative and is focusing on clinical trials involving stem cell transplantations in IBD. Some minor comments should be addressed:

- Throughout the manuscript some grammatical and language errors should be corrected. E.g., the title "Therapy with Stem Cell in Inflammatory Bowel Disease (IBD)." should read "Therapy with Stem Cells in Inflammatory Bowel Disease (IBD)." - Some statements lack the references; please add the appropriate references. These include: o P.1: "It is estimated that in Europe 1.4 million and one million people may have UC and CD, respectively." o P. 9: "The treatment scheme most widely used in CD is cyclophosphamide 1.5-2g/m² and granulocyte colony stimulating factor (G-CSF) 10 µg/kg/day." - P.1: "Furthermore, in the last few decades there has been an increase in the disease in low-incidence zones[2, 3]." Please add information on the "low-incidence zones" - which countries? - P.2 and ongoing: greek symbols (e.g. alpha) are not in correct format - P. 5: "In recent years there have been major advances in aspects that are believed to be involved in the development of IBD." Not "advances in the aspect" but "advances in the knowledge of the aspects" - P. 8: "They present glycoproteins CD34+ and CD133+ at surface level and can only differentiate towards cells pertaining to hematological cell lines[70]." #70 is not the correct reference. Also, it is under debate if HSCs can only differentiate towards hematological lineages - see e.g. the debate in liver. A more subtle statement is necessary.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5934

Title: Therapy with Stem Cell in Inflammatory Bowel Disease (IBD).

Reviewer code: 00004594

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 11:33

Date reviewed: 2013-11-03 19:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very good review on stem cell therapies for IBD. The review is well written, very educational and updated. I have only minor suggestions: - The pages of the manuscript are not numbered, - In the introduction: replace "profound remission" by "deep remission" which is the accurate denomination. Replace "endoscopic healing of the mucosal lesions" by "mucosal healing". Mucosal healing is also the gold standard for ulcerative colitis and "histological healing" is also an additional target for some authors. Replace "dose escalation" by "optimization (dose escalation and/or reduced interval of administration)". I don't think that "colectomy may solve the problem" in ulcerative colitis; this is a simplistic view since ileo-rectal anastomosis needs further treatment and ileo-anal anastomosis is complicated by pouchitis and others.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5934

Title: Therapy with Stem Cell in Inflammatory Bowel Disease (IBD).

Reviewer code: 00012309

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 11:33

Date reviewed: 2013-11-04 22:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review of stem cells for IBD and other disorders is well organized and presented. I might only wonder whether the authors would be willing to clearly stress that these daring approaches find their almost exclusive indication for patients with CD, thus leaving unanswered the problems of those with unresponsive UC; for them, as it is known, the surgical option remains the mainstay.