

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5543

Title: Outcomes of Endoscopic Submucosal Dissection for Epstein-Barr Virus-Associated Lymphoepithelioma-like Early Gastric Carcinomas

Reviewer code: 00503601

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-09-16 09:50

Date reviewed: 2013-09-17 12:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Fairly well written case series of 4 cases of EBV associated LELC which have shown good outcomes on follow up after ESD. Minor grammatical corrections only. The figures are well illustrative

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5543

Title: Outcomes of Endoscopic Submucosal Dissection for Epstein-Barr Virus-Associated Lymphoepithelioma-like Early Gastric Carcinomas

Reviewer code: 00048752

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-09-16 09:50

Date reviewed: 2013-09-20 14:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a presentation of 4 cases of EB virus associated lymphoepithelioma-like early gastric cancer treated by ESD. Although this report is interesting, the number of the cases are small and it is difficult to compare clinical outcome to the ESD for non EB associated gastric cancer.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5543

Title: Outcomes of Endoscopic Submucosal Dissection for Epstein-Barr Virus-Associated Lymphoepithelioma-like Early Gastric Carcinomas

Reviewer code: 00034993

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-09-16 09:50

Date reviewed: 2013-09-27 15:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to Author In this study, the authors reported that four cases of EBV-associated early lymphoepithelioma-like gastric carcinoma (LELC) treated by endoscopic submucosal dissection (ESD) with their long-term outcomes after endoscopic resection. Although the pathologic review of ESD specimen revealed deep submucosal invasion more than 500 μ m in all cases, none of these cases showed local recurrence or distant metastases during more than 20 months of medical follow-up after ESD. In finally, authors recommended that conservative management strategy without additional surgery might be considered for EBV positive early LELC treated by ESD. Although this study is interesting and informational, this study has any problems in this version. Please revise carefully according to comments. Major comments: 1. The pathologic review of ESD specimen revealed deep submucosal invasion more than 500 μ m in all cases. In general, patients diagnosed as gastric cancer with deep submucosal invasion is not applicable for ESD treatment. 2. How did authors these patients as EBV-associated early lymphoepithelioma-like gastric carcinoma (LELC)? 3. Major influenced factor of gastric cancer is H. pylori infection. Authors should add information of H. pylori infection and gastric mucosal atrophy. 4. Please show pictures of endoscopic findings/EUS/pathology in all four patients.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5543

Title: Outcomes of Endoscopic Submucosal Dissection for Epstein-Barr Virus-Associated Lymphoepithelioma-like Early Gastric Carcinomas

Reviewer code: 00069394

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-09-16 09:50

Date reviewed: 2013-09-29 01:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is the report of 4 cases of EBV-associated early lymphoepithelioma-like gastric carcinoma (LELC) treated by endoscopic submucosal dissection (ESD) with long-term outcome. However, the number of cases is too small to make a conclusion that treatment of EBV-associated early LELC by ESD will get the favorable outcome. Moreover, this cancer type has been reported to have a favorable prognosis compared with ordinary gastric carcinoma. Thus the result obtained may be similar to other treatment modalities, please discuss in more detail regarding this point.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5543

Title: Outcomes of Endoscopic Submucosal Dissection for Epstein-Barr Virus-Associated Lymphoepithelioma-like Early Gastric Carcinomas

Reviewer code: 00070894

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-09-16 09:50

Date reviewed: 2013-10-11 11:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper was a case report which describe four cases of EBV-associated early LELC treated by endoscopic submucosal dissection (ESD) with their long-term outcomes after endoscopic resection. While the topic was interesting. The report provided a new treatment for EBV-associated early LELC. Conservative management strategy without additional surgery might be considered for EBV-positive early LELC treated by ESD. The report can help guide other clinicians faced with a similar problem as higher levels of evidence are just simply not available due to the rarity of the condition. But we want to understand more detailed data for the cases, and manuscript was not very well written. For the benefit of the reader, however, a number of points need clarifying and certain statements require further justification. There are given below. The report can help guide other clinicians faced with a similar problem as higher levels of evidence are just simply not available due to the rarity of the condition.

- Chapter introduction has to be improved. We need more focus on the treatment strategy of EBV-associated early LELC. Here is no sufficient describe of the standard treatment radical gastrectomy with extensive D2 LN dissection for LELC. You had better add the detailed efficacy and side effect of the past therapy.
- In our opinion, the diagnosis of the rare disease is critical for us. You had better give the diagnosis criteria for EBV-associated early LELC in introduction part.
- In the discussion part of the article, we also want to know the efficacy and side effect of ESD therapy, for example benign gastric cancer.
- However, the number of cases is too small to make a conclusion that treatment of EBV-associated early LELC by ESD will get the favorable outcome.