

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5713

Title: Transjugular intrahepatic portosystemic shunt with covered stent for hepatocellular carcinoma patients with tumor thrombus in main portal vein

Reviewer code: 00058381

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-24 08:59

Date reviewed: 2013-09-27 02:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting manuscript on an important subject. The main drawbacks of this study are retrospective data collection and a relatively low patient number. However, these shortcomings will not be changed by revision. In any case, a major revision of linguistic and stylistic problems is required.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5713

Title: Transjugular intrahepatic portosystemic shunt with covered stent for hepatocellular carcinoma patients with tumor thrombus in main portal vein

Reviewer code: 00005216

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-24 08:59

Date reviewed: 2013-09-29 14:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The Authors report their experience in treating patients with hepatocellular carcinoma and portal vein invasion by inserting a transjugular intrahepatic portosystemic shunt with a covered stent. The paper covers a clinically relevant issue and is enjoyable. My suggestions for improvement are the followings: a) discuss the advantages, if any, of using covered stents instead of bare metal stents for patients with short (<6 months) life expectancy b) indicate whether patients had undergone systemic treatment after TIPS placement, or not; c) have the paper edited by a mother-tongue editor.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5713

Title: Transjugular intrahepatic portosystemic shunt with covered stent for hepatocellular carcinoma patients with tumor thrombus in main portal vein

Reviewer code: 00068443

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-24 08:59

Date reviewed: 2013-09-30 15:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In their present manuscript, Zhao and colleagues show that TIPS with covered stent for hepatocellular carcinoma patients with tumor thrombus in the main portal vein is feasible procedure. Major comments The Patency of covered stents in patients treated by TIPS during the short-time and long-time follow-up was not evaluated? The manuscript should be well polished. Minor comments: the manuscript needs more literature review.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5713

Title: Transjugular intrahepatic portosystemic shunt with covered stent for hepatocellular carcinoma patients with tumor thrombus in main portal vein

Reviewer code: 01560071

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-24 08:59

Date reviewed: 2013-10-03 00:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors evaluated the effects of TIPS for portal hypertension-related symptoms (gastrointestinal bleeding and refractory ascites) caused by main portal vein tumor thrombus in HCC cases, and showed that TIPS might improve the symptoms. However, as known in general, presence of main portal vein tumor thrombus means end-stage of HCC, in which best supportive care would be suitable. In fact, the mean survival after TIPS was only 5.67 months. I cannot understand the significance of an invasive procedure like TIPS in such a situation.