

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5545

Title: Association of Insulin, IGF-1 and IGFBPs with the Risk of Colorectal Cancers

Reviewer code: 00504962

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-09-16 10:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-28 13:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors evaluated the relationship of changes in serum insulin, Insulin-like growth factor-1 (IGF-1), Insulin-like growth factor binding proteins (IGFBPs), body mass index (BMI), waist-to-hip ratio (WHR) with the initiation and progression of colorectal cancers. The serum levels of insulin and IGF-1 as well as IGF-1/IGFBP-3 ratio of pre-surgical patients were elevated, but the level of IGFBP-3 was reduced with post-surgical patients. WHR and BMI of colon cancer patients were positively and correlated with the levels of insulin and IGF-1/IGFBP-3, but the correlation of WHR and BMI with IGFBP-3 level was negative. Comments: They have concluded that the elevation of insulin, IGF-1 as well as IGF-1/IGFBP-3 ratio and the reduction of IGFBP-3 may relate to the initiation of colorectal cancer. The findings are novel and interesting. I have several concerns as follows. 1. The reviewer miss a significance of IGF-1, IGFBP-1 and IGFBP-3 IGF-1/IGFBP3 ratio in patients of colorectal cancer. Author should present the significance of IGF-1, IGFBP-1 and IGFBP-3 IGF-1/IGFBP3 ratio in the cancer. 2. The subjects in the present study may have several medical treatment. Is it possibility that the drugs influenced on the results including insulin and IGFs in the present study? 3. It would be better to add regarding gender differences. Did the levels of circulating IGFs similarly change both in male and female? 4. Did the elevation of insulin, IGF-1 and the reduction of IGFBP-3 relate to only colorectal cancer? Similar changes were not observed in other cancer such as lung cancer? Some comments would be helpful. 5. The manuscript has several strengths including a significant topic of interest that pathophysiological links IGFs and colorectal cancer. Author should discuss the pathophysiological mechanisms between IGFs and colorectal cancer in greater detail.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5545

Title: Association of Insulin, IGF-1 and IGFBPs with the Risk of Colorectal Cancers

Reviewer code: 02446514

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-09-16 10:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-31 08:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The investigation is interesting, but I would like to point out some considerations. 1. Abstract. It is mentioned that BMI has a correlation with cancer, which in the results it is not. 2. Methods. A. Some sentences such as "The patients should be collected before and after operation" should be corrected. (may be they can ask for helping in the style). B. Details about the time course of the disease (what does it mean "before and after surgery") in order the authors can refer to initiation and progression of the cancer. 3. Results. Number 2, I think the sentence is wrong or may be expressed in other form, it is confuse. Number 4, also the results are confuse in one sentence said: "The levels of serum IGF-1, IGFBP1 and IGF-1/IGFBP3 ratio were significantly higher in rectal cancer patients than colon" and the next: "while there were no statistical differences in leptin, insulin and IGFBP-3 levels between the two groups" Number 7 and table 7, it appears as repetitive information, the table should indicate the significance of T1, T2, T3. Units must be presented in all the tables. 4. Discussion. It is long, the authors refer to the literature in which have been reported relation between cancer and alimentation, but they could focus on their own results. Although they present some evidence of the association of some serum biomarkers I think are not conclusive. They mention in the method section that have information that include age, occupation, education, ethnic group, so they may analyze that with the serum biomarkers