

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5640

Title: The role of prophylactic antibiotics in cirrhotic patients with variceal bleeding: A systematic review

Reviewer code: 01560498

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-18 14:25

Date reviewed: 2013-09-25 19:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Bacterial infection is critical for cirrhotic patients with variceal bleeding, and this is sometimes fatal for cirrhotic patient. Some references are old, but the reference list involves important papers. Also, important guidelines of ACG, AASLD, BSG and WGO are referred. I consider your review article is informative for WJG readers.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5640

Title: The role of prophylactic antibiotics in cirrhotic patients with variceal bleeding: A systematic review

Reviewer code: 02519060

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-18 14:25

Date reviewed: 2013-09-27 18:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Evidence on prophylactic use of antibiotics for cirrhotic patients with variceal bleeding is not sufficient. This review article is well written and provides enough information to the readers of WJG.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5640

Title: The role of prophylactic antibiotics in cirrhotic patients with variceal bleeding: A systematic review

Reviewer code: 01489386

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-18 14:25

Date reviewed: 2013-10-07 08:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I read with interest the review article titled: "The role of prophylactic antibiotics in cirrhotic patients with variceal bleeding; a systematic review" The authors were able to summarize available data and recommendations of gastroenterology associations for treatment of variceal bleeding with antibiotics. Here are the points that need to be addressed: Major comments: 1. The authors need to check with the editors to see if there is a need to present a section as " methods" in a review article. In a sense, this is mostly a review article rather than an metanalysis or a systemic review. Therefore , need to remove the part "a systemic review" from the title as well. Similarly, using a results section would not be appropriate. 2. Reference to the table 1 at the conclusion of the article is misplaced. The authors need to place that within the first paragraphs of the main discussion. Minor comments: 1. in abstract page 2 paragraph 1 line 6; correct for the appropriate plural subject, change has to have and is to are. 2. Introduction, page 2 last paragraph, need to edit the second sentence as it is not well expressed: the prevalence of what? 3. Page 4 second paragraph need to be connected to the first but a new paragraph to be started at line 4. 4. Line 6: not clear what was found to occur in 47%. Need rephrasing. 5. similarly lines 7-10 need to be rephrased. 6. Remove line 14 page 4 7. Page 5 line 12 the sentence need to be removed as it is redundant. 8. Page 5 third paragraph line 10, need to rephrase the sentence regarding pyogenic meningitis. 9. Page 6 second paragraph line 2 remove the question mark. 10. Page 6 Line 4 same paragraph is redundant. 11. Page 8 line 7 change od to once daily 12. Page 8 line 15 change "a" to "an". 13. Page 9 first paragraph line 2 " is " is missing. 14. Page 9 second paragraph line 10 need rephrasing as it is incomprehensible.. 15. Page 10 last paragraph is not relevant and need complete editing.. 16. Conclusion section line 6 requires "initiated" to be added in



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

the middle of the sentence. 17. Table need another column to explain timing of antibiotics and mortality.