



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5843

Title: How about the therapeutic effect of acupuncture to treat irritable bowel syndrome: a meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 02442330

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-29 13:36

Date reviewed: 2013-10-31 22:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors give summary data about the pathophysiology of IBS. There are missing the data about the alterations in the bowel wall in IBS-patients (for example increased mast cells and lymphocytes, increased cytokines, increased secretion of stimulants of nerve cells, altered serotonin pathways). Different statements about IBS prevalence in the introduction and in the discussion should be brought into line. Despite bearing in mind that the number of randomized studies are small, the following subgroup analyses would be of interest: 1) meta-analysis of the five studies with Jadad score > 3 2) meta-analysis of the four studies against sham acupuncture



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5843

Title: How about the therapeutic effect of acupuncture to treat irritable bowel syndrome: a meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 02483407

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-29 13:36

Date reviewed: 2013-11-02 01:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is necessary to check formatting. The English needs to be revised (minor). There are several orthographic errors. I don't see the need for figure 4 and 5. Just at text is sufficient. Some items may be discussed: the spontaneous remission of symptoms, the potential placebo effects of acupuncture that should not be despised, the possible neurological physiology of IBS. Although the results suggest a benefit of acupuncture, the authors must make clear that there is insufficient data to recommend the method as first-line treatment. Moreover, there is insufficient data to know about long-term results.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5843

Title: How about the therapeutic effect of acupuncture to treat irritable bowel syndrome: a meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 00004594

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-29 13:36

Date reviewed: 2013-11-08 12:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting paper on the effect of acupuncture in IBS. There are few data in this domain. Although the result of this study is positive, the authors temper their data which seems correct for me. I have minor comments. - Introduction, first line: suppress "usually in the lower abdomen" - Introduction, second paragraph: specify that IBS is due to a perturbation of the brain-gut axis. Replace "And inspite" by "Despite" - Introduction, last paragraph: replace "we did meta-analysis" by "we performed a meta-analysis" - Data synthesis and statistical analysis: "All analysis were performed using STATA..." - Discussion, second paragraph: "In many researched" is not correct - Discussion, last paragraph: "Thirdly, because assessment of improvement was not the same and note detailed..."