

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5292

Title: Stereotactic Body Radiotherapy for Oligometastases within the Nodal Area from Colorectal Cancer

Reviewer code: 00398767

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-28 14:29

Date reviewed: 2013-09-06 05:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written and very informative review paper on the stereotactic body radiation therapy (SBRT) of nodal oligometastases from colon cancer. The manuscript is well written and clear. It provides useful information and practical suggestions for the treatment of this clinical condition. Most aspects of the practice of the CyberKnife SBRT are discussed. For these reasons, the manuscript deserves, to me, consideration for publication.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5292

Title: Stereotactic Body Radiotherapy for Oligometastases within the Nodal Area from Colorectal Cancer

Reviewer code: 00736646

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-28 14:29

Date reviewed: 2013-09-06 10:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The term of oligometastases within the nodal area and oligo-nodal metastasis is not appropriate expression. This state is oligo-recurrence (Niibe et al. Jpn J Clin Oncol 1\40: 107-111, 2010). Because, there are 1-5 recurrent tumors with primary lesions controlled. Thus, you should correct these expressions as follows. First term (title) is oligo-recurrence within the nodal area. Second term is oligo-recurrence in the lymph node. These corrections are essential to be published. You mention abscopal effect in this review. Conventional radiation therapy rarely induces abscopal effect. There are two reports about this status. You should cite these two case reports (Okuma et al. J Med Case Rep 5: 111. Takaya et al. Anticancer Res 27(1B): 499-503, 2007).

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5292

Title: Stereotactic Body Radiotherapy for Oligometastases within the Nodal Area from Colorectal Cancer

Reviewer code: 00059401

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-28 14:29

Date reviewed: 2013-11-21 03:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors addresses an important topic on stereotactic body radiotherapy for oligo-recurrence within nodal area from colorectal cancer, with particular emphasis on the patient selection, clinical outcome, dose and toxicity. The review is comprehensive and clear and provides valuable information about SBRT. There are still a few minor changes needed for the manuscript before its publishing. 1. Given the fact that abscopal effect is a rare and poorly understood event, more literatures about its possible mechanism are needed. 2. For the clinical outcome part, the possible reasons of the variety in 5y disease free survival rate between the studies need to be further discussed. There are also a few typos need to be fixed.