

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5826

Title: Platelet count/spleen diameter ratio to predict esophageal varices in hepatic cirrhosis

Reviewer code: 00646393

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-27 11:05

Date reviewed: 2013-10-01 09:26

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---|--|-------------------------------------|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | language polishing | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting study in which whether ratio of platelet count to spleen diameter can be a predictive factor for existence of esophageal varices was examined in Mexican patients with hepatic cirrhosis. This paper validated the usefulness of platelet count/spleen diameter ratio and determined a cutoff value for the Mexican, which is a little smaller than the value found in the Caucasian population; suggest that this ratio may be racial specific. Therefore, the author should include racial information in their title to avoid miss leading. Also, if the authors can provide a value of platelet count to spleen diameter in age-matched healthy population, which will help to understand whether this value is dynamically changed in hepatic cirrhosis patients by comparing with the patients without esophageal varices.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5826

Title: Platelet count/spleen diameter ratio to predict esophageal varices in hepatic cirrhosis

Reviewer code: 00504290

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-27 11:05

Date reviewed: 2013-10-04 13:20

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Table 1: How about the prevalence of hepatitis B infection in these cases? 2. Page 7 (text) described the etiology of cryptogenic in nine (9.8%) and primary cirrhosis in seven (7.6%). But in table 1, the percentage of others is only 8.7% (in 8 cases). Discrepancy is present. 3. Table 1: total 91 cases. But for etiology, the information was given in only 83 cases. Please check

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5826

Title: Platelet count/spleen diameter ratio to predict esophageal varices in hepatic cirrhosis

Reviewer code: 00503401

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-27 11:05

Date reviewed: 2013-10-14 04:08

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) Specify if the research concentrate only on oesophageal varices, but not the gastric ones. Otherwise include the presence of gastric varices in description also. 2) Reduce the length of introduction, concentrate on the purpose of the study 3) Materials and methods. Modify the second paragraph. It is unnecessary to describe that bilirubin and albumin were measured, these parameters are necessary for Child-Pugh score calculation. Thus, consider deletion of the statement that Child-Pugh score was based on the presence of ascites and encephalopathy. 4) The diameter is longest, not "largest" 5) "Upper" gastrointestinal endoscopy, not "high" 6) Specify the formula used for the calculation of platelet / spleen diameter ratio 7) Results. Specify if virus-related cases of cirrhosis were all attributed to chronic HCV infection and there were no case of HBV cirrhosis. 8) Discussion. The 70% specificity can be characterized "intermediate?", rather than "high" 9) Comment in discussion that the NPV of the platelet / spleen diameter ratio is low (40%) 10) Ref. 6 is not up to date. See: de Franchis R; Baveno V Faculty. Revising consensus in portal hypertension: report of the Baveno V consensus workshop on methodology of diagnosis and therapy in portal hypertension. J Hepatol. 2010 ;53(4):762-8. doi: 10.1016/j.jhep.2010.06.004.