



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4571

Title: Association of RAGE Gene Three Polymorphisms with Crohn's Disease Susceptibility in a Chinese Han Population

Reviewer code: 00069297

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-07-08 15:15

Date reviewed: 2013-07-11 08:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to the article entitled "Association of RAGE Gene Three Polymorphisms with Crohn's Disease Susceptibility in a Chinese Han Population". The report investigates genetic variants at the RAGE loci and association with Crohn's Disease in a Chinese population, with a combined study of total 791 cases and controls. Although the results presented here could be interesting, the article needs a serious and deep revision to be considered for publication. 1) The authors declared that "312 CD patients and 479 healthy controls were age- and sex-matched", but the number of cases were 312, the number of controls were 479. So the cases were NOT age- and sex-matched with the controls. Actually, in Table 1, 42 patients were diagnosis under 17 years, but the controls were not pointed out how many people under 17 years. 2) The statistical analysis reported in the manuscript was appropriate. Although, the study should give a reasonable power analysis to detect an association, and explain why the number of samples in the manuscript could (or not) support a conclusion. The reviewer believed the sample size in this study perhaps was not large enough for a case-control population study. 3) The recent publications in the same field are missing. Did the authors compare their results with recent GWAS, especially the studies using Chinese cohorts? They should write some comments in the discussion. 4) The reviewer has questions about the selections of the "three SNPs". 5) The possible associations between the selected SNPs and RAGE expression (mRNA and proteins) and/or clinical symptoms were missing. This could enhance the conclusion.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4571

Title: Association of RAGE Gene Three Polymorphisms with Crohn's Disease Susceptibility in a Chinese Han Population

Reviewer code: 02446061

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-07-08 15:15

Date reviewed: 2013-07-12 23:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear authors: I found pionner data about RAGE polymorphism association with Crohn's disease in your manuscript. However, I suggest some changes in order to improve presentation before to consider the publication of this manuscript. a) Please check the entire manuscript in order to avoid typing an punctuation errors (Conh's, hapotypes, did'nt among others sould be corrected). b) Please clarify if some relationship exist between Table 1 of your manuscript and the article which is linked to this Table (PLoS One. 2012; 7(6): e39814.) If all data are collected from a single population should be mentioned in your manuscript and cite the article about original project or any previously reported with the common studied population. c) The major suggestion from me on this manuscript is about improving approach the known functions suggested for RAGE and the probable implication of polymorphism with greater detail as is herein presented (you can include references such as (1) Sterenczak KA, Nolte I, Murua Escobar H.RAGE splicing variants in mammals. Methods Mol Biol. 2013;963:265-76, (2)Rouhiainen A, Kuja-Panula J, Tumova S, Rauvala H. RAGE-mediated cell signaling. Methods Mol Biol. 2013;963:239-63.). Also you can infer in better form the impact of your Gene-polymorphism detected if you infer about the traslational consequences of the presence of any of the three reported polymorphism. This can be made by a carefully analysis of posible consequences in protein sequence (inclusively by a quick analysis using computational tools from NCBI) and revision on the reported data. With best regards, Reviewer