

**ESPS Peer-review Report**
**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10802

**Title:** Helicobacter pylori infection in patients with selective IgE deficiency

**Reviewer code:** 00199528

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-20 16:04

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-28 14:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

the topic of the study is very interesting and it is evaluating the immunologic association between a rare disease of IgE deficiency and h. pylori infection. however, there is major statistical error. Authors want to design a "retrospective" case-control study. they compare endoscopic finding and response to eradication treatment in IgE deficient individuals with that IgE normal controls. however case-control studies should be done by clearly defining "case" and "control". in this study who is the "case"; individuals with low IgE, individuals with low IgE and dyspepsia or individuals with low IgE and dyspepsia and H. pylori positive by UBT. then controls should be chosen accordingly. if the case was 43 individuals with low IgE, then all 223 controls must be questioned for the dyspepsia and underwent UBT and/or endoscopy with H.pylori evaluation. other wise all the statistical test used are invalid. my comment is either to redefine the case and do statistical analysis accordingly or to report the data as a descriptive study.

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10802

**Title:** Helicobacter pylori infection in patients with selective IgE deficiency

**Reviewer code:** 01433781

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-20 16:04

**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-05 21:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

# COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The beneficial properties of IgE require elucidation. Selective IgE deficiency is defined as a significant decrease in the levels of IgE (<2.5 int.units/mL) in a patient whose other immunoglobulin levels, including IgG subclasses and IgA levels, are normal. It is a laboratory finding that does not necessarily equate to a clinical disorder. The prevalence depends upon the population under study. There is some evidence that IgE antibodies play a protective role against viral, parasitic, and bacterial infections in humans. This study by Eli Magen et al investigated the prevalence and clinical characteristics of Helicobacter pylori infection in dyspeptic patients with IgE deficiency. They found more H. pylori positive gastritis in patients with IgE deficiency compare to controls. Eradication rate for legacy triple therapy was statistically inferior in the IgE deficiency group compare to the control, but interestingly eradication rate was similar for Levofloxacin-based triple therapy in case and control group. This information could be of interest for clinicians regarding patients with IgE deficiency The manuscript is nicely presented, well structured, and the discussion and conclusions consistent with the results. Minor Comments: I got a lot of problems reading the paper because, especially in the last part, almost all spaces among the words are missing. I do not believe they are typing errors. Maybe something happened downloading the paper!!

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10802

**Title:** Helicobacter pylori infection in patients with selective IgE deficiency

**Reviewer code:** 00068278

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-20 16:04

**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-07 02:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

# COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Isolated IgE hypogammaglobulinemia is rare and its contribution to host defense is controversial. The authors investigated the prevalence of Hp infection among dyspeptic patients with/without IgE deficiency and evaluated response to eradication therapy. The topic is interesting but its presentation needs revision. 1-How many controls were sampled for each case, 10 or 20? a-In "subject" section, it was stated that "The Control group was randomly sampled with a case-control ratio of ten controls for each case (1:20) from the remaining subjects aged  $\geq 12$  years old, with serum total IgE of  $\geq 2$  kIU/L, clinical symptoms of dyspepsia and a positive C13-UBT. b-In results (demographic and laboratory characteristics of cases and controls): There were 158 subjects with IgED and control group included 1,500 subjects (1:9.5). In the following sentence, it was written that there were 718 dyspeptic subjects among 3,160 (158:3160=1:20) control group subjects (total IgE  $\geq 2$  kIU/L). What is the difference between 2 control groups? 2-The ratio of C13-UBT positivity in dyspeptic case group is not 20.5% (32:158) but is 74.4% (32:43). The ratio of C13-UBT positivity in control group is 31.1% (223:718), not 7.1% (223:3,160).

**ESPS Peer-review Report**
**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10802

**Title:** Helicobacter pylori infection in patients with selective IgE deficiency

**Reviewer code:** 00506513

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-20 16:04

**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-07 11:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This manuscript contains interesting observation. The authors describe that the correlation between IgE deficiency and H. pylori-related dyspepsia. However, it is unclear whether IgE deficient patients are compromised to H. pylori infection or easier to deteriorate dyspepsia, such as gastritis. If possible, rate of H. pylori infection in IgE-deficient patient group and other patient group should be presented. Setting denominators is inappropriate. Example 1: In Table 2, GE endoscopy findings, such as gastritis, should be expressed as relative values to number of subjects examined GE endoscopy, which is set as 100%. Example 2: In Table 1, HP positive dyspepsia should be expressed as relative values to number of patients with dyspepsia, which is set as 100%. p. 4, line 15 and 20: "all subjects ----,having performed serum total IgE measurement and 13C-urea breath test---": Is this true? According to the description in results section, a part of subjects examined 13C-urea breath test. p. 4, line 19: "ten controls" should be "twenty controls".