

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10642

**Title:** Radiation therapy has been shown to be adaptable for various stages of HCC-Review Article

**Reviewer code:** 00713469

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-11 11:22

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-14 22:28

| CLASSIFICATION  | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION   |
|---|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing     | Google Search:                      | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept             |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)                 |  | BPG Search:                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected                           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records |  |

# COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General Comments The authors present a review about the use of radiation therapy in HCC, its current implementation and modalities. Although such an approach appears to be not yet consolidated and supported by guidelines it is promising. The topic could be crucial in the actual contest since novel treatments and their combination is required. The paper appears well written and structured correctly. The idea is good. The messages are clearly reported and they could be useful for the readers. It could constitute a dynamic, smart guide for radiologists and gastroenterologists. Even if simply structured it could be of value. Positive comments and minor essential revisions 1. The manuscript has been structured properly, according to the aim of the study. 2. References: appear to adequate 3. be aware ! a justified number of tables is lacking. Since it appears to be a review it should hold a more iconographic trait. 4. The mentioned papers and trials appear to be restricted to the "Asian" patients whereas a more "global" approach is required (see South America). 5. line 12 page 13: please, replace cytocidal with cytotoxic.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**
**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10642

**Title:** Radiation therapy has been shown to be adaptable for various stages of HCC-Review Article

**Reviewer code:** 00736646

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-11 11:22

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-17 22:28

| CLASSIFICATION                                     | LANGUAGE EVALUATION   | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION   |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing                 | Google Search:                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)            |   | BPG Search:                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected                            | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|  |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No records |  |

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This review article describes the radiation therapy for various stages of HCC. However, this review is not enough to describe the above mentioned. First, it is not easy to understand the authors' explanation because of lacking the appropriate Tables to summarize it. Recently, prolongation of advanced HCC patients' survival, thus, we meet the patients with a few number of metastases. This situation means oligometastases or oligo-recurrence (Niibe Y et al. Jpn J Clin Oncol 40: 107 - 111, 2010). The authors had better cite this paper and describe and discuss the oligometastases and oligo-recurrence of HCC. Especially, patients of oligo-recurrence are the good candidates to be longer-survivors. Descriptions to compare the surgery with radiation therapy will be more required. This paper had better be checked by expert radiation oncologists.