

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14675

Title: Role of Ghrelin-GOAT system in the pathogenesis of Non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 02079515

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-10-20 17:16

Date reviewed: 2014-10-24 15:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is interesting, however it does not add relevant novelties.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14675

Title: Role of Ghrelin-GOAT system in the pathogenesis of Non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 02715825

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-10-20 17:16

Date reviewed: 2014-12-09 21:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript Number: 14675 The manuscript entitled: Role of Ghrelin-GOAT system in the pathogenesis of Non-alcoholic fatty liver disease addresses a right vision about this hormone and its pathological role in NAFLD. These are minor comments referred to style in order to improve the manuscript. First, please, be aware of grammar failures (Page 3, line 6, revalent) and abbreviations (DAG). Second, Although the two-hits hypothesis of NAFLD pathogenesis is currently the most recognized theory, the author should at least mention the multi-hit hypothesis, which is gaining strength. Finally, references could be completed with current articles (Li Z, Xu G, Qin Y, Zhang C, Tang H, Yin Y, Xiang X, Li Y, Zhao J, Mulholland M, Zhang W. Ghrelin promotes hepatic lipogenesis by activation of mTOR-PPAR γ signaling pathway. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2014 Sep 9;111(36):13163-8. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1411571111. Epub 2014 Aug 25 or Arslan N, Sayin O, Tokgoz Y. Evaluation of serum xenin and ghrelin levels and their relationship with nonalcoholic fatty liver disease and insulin resistance in obese adolescents. J Endocrinol Invest. 2014 Sep 9. [Epub ahead of print]).

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14675

Title: Role of Ghrelin-GOAT system in the pathogenesis of Non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 00058441

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-10-20 17:16

Date reviewed: 2014-12-09 22:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review paper is focusing on the pathological role of Ghrelin-GOAT system for the development of NAFLD. This topic is interesting and also important for scientists who study energy homeostasis. I have some questions and suggestions: 1) English editing: I have found lots of typing errors in this manuscript. For examples: Page3 relevant? prevalent Page5 synthetised?synthesized Page5 The concept that in addition to the important endocrine effect of acylated ghrelin, the paracrine effects of locally synthetised and acylated ghrelin may be important, was supported by identification of GOAT expression in various tissues. ?sentence is too complicated Page6 mediumchain? medium chain Page6 improved?improve Page6 pathways?pathway Page6 an critical therapeutic agent? a critical therapeutic agent(too many) 2)GOAT appears to regulate post-translation of Ghrelin. acylated form can act on GHS-R but DAG is not. However, DAG is more abundant form and also play some roles in NASH patients. These facts make the Ghrelin/GOAT/NAFLD story very complicated and confusing. Not mention that leptin is regulating GOAT and also compete with acylated Ghrelin on the same receptor, GHS-R. I would like to suggest that authors may focus on acylated Ghrelin first



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

without discussing DAG. Then, combining DAG and GHS-R-independent action of acylated Ghrelin in NAFLD together as one section.