

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 13904

**Title:** Lack of Correlation Between two Assays for Quantification of Regulatory T-Cells in IBD Patients

**Reviewer code:** 00038879

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-07 19:03

**Date reviewed:** 2014-09-25 05:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good short study. My comments: 1. In the Abstract and Discussion the authors conclude that the 2 tested assays are not equivalent to measure nTregs and iTregs. Are the authors implying that one method is testing one subtype rather than the other? they should clarify this point. 2. As the authors mention in the Discussion it is possible that one explanation for their results is that Foxp3 is present in non-Tregs cells. Indeed, it has clearly been shown in the recent past that Tregs, Th1 and Th17 are indeed the same cell - expressing one gene or the other depending on the microenvironment. The authors should expand this aspect. 3. The results of the 2 methods are compared in the table - however I don't see calculated p values. Why?

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 13904

**Title:** Lack of Correlation Between two Assays for Quantification of Regulatory T-Cells in IBD Patients

**Reviewer code:** 00074323

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-07 19:03

**Date reviewed:** 2014-10-06 17:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors clearly show that there is poor correlation between two different methods for measuring Tregs in peripheral blood. Thus, studies on Tregs in various inflammatory disorders should be read with great caution. Sample and methods are adequate to support results. It is true to state that the two methods evaluated may reflect the identification of different types of Tregs (natural or induced), but also conventional activated T cells can share many phenotypic features with Tregs. For example, in IPEX syndrome, activated FOXP3<sup>high</sup> cells can be found in blood, which likely represent activated T cells.