

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14603

Title: LESSONS FROM RARE TUMORS: LYMPHOEPITELIOMA-LIKE CARCINOMAS

Reviewer's code: 00740600

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-10-15 13:58

Date reviewed: 2014-11-11 21:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript reviews the literature on the Lymphoepitelioma-like hepatic carcinomas. The theme is interesting. The article is well written, but it has many abbreviations, which makes reading difficult. The authors should include a better description concerning the clinical, radiological and histological diagnosis of these carcinomas. More importantly, there should be a discussion about the differential diagnoses and how to differentiate Lymphoepitelioma-like carcinomas of other pathologies. There should be pictures showing the radiological and histological features of these carcinomas, as well as a detailed description of the radiological and histological changes commonly associated with this Pathology.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14603

Title: LESSONS FROM RARE TUMORS: LYMPHOEPITELIOMA-LIKE CARCINOMAS

Reviewer's code: 02860836

Reviewer's country: Belgium

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-10-15 13:58

Date reviewed: 2014-11-12 20:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The subject of the review is very appealing and of clinical value. The manuscript is well written but it lacks the supportive figures and tables. - Macroscopic and microscopic images of LEL-HCCs and LEL-ICCs in comparison with the HCC/ICC counterpart should be included. Immunohistochemical stainings for T-cel markers could support the review even further. - An overview table with the clinicopathological features of the reported LEL-HCCs and LEL-ICCs should be included as well. -A schematic drawing of the working hypothesis might clarify the detailed enumeration of the possible involved cytokines. -The difference in EBV status should be discussed more in detail. Is it possible that EBV activity is increased in LEL-ICCs due to age-related immunosenescence or another underlying cause?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14603

Title: LESSONS FROM RARE TUMORS: LYMPHOEPITELIOMA-LIKE CARCINOMAS

Reviewer's code: 02861159

Reviewer's country: France

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-10-15 13:58

Date reviewed: 2014-11-10 19:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General comments: This review is well written, interesting and of clinical relevance, since pathophysiology and clinical behaviour of hepatic LEL carcinomas differ from classical HCC and ICC. However, the following issues should be addressed to further improve the manuscript: Major comments: - If possible, at least one picture of each tumor type should be added (macroscopy + hematoxylin-eosin staining ± immunohistochemistry). - only 7/18 LEL-HCC and 6/24 LEL-ICC were developed on a background of cirrhosis, unlike classical HCC and ICC. This characteristic should be added and underlined in the discussion. - markers of stemness (CD133, EpCAM) were positive in all tested LEL-ICC cases (5/5). Was there any pathological features of combined hepatocellular-cholangiocarcinoma in these tumors? Please detail it in the manuscript. Minor comments: - Abstract: "In spite of their rarity, intra-hepatic lymphoepitelioma-like carcinomas are of general interest, as their clinical course and outcome are remarkably more favorable than classical hepatocellular carcinomas and intra-hepatic cholangiocarcinomas" should be better. - Discussion, p 4: "The above data indicate that intra-hepatic LEL carcinomas are characterized by a significantly longer survival than classical HCC and ICC of corresponding tumor stage" should be better. -



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Discussion, p 6: "The clinical behaviour, as well as pathological and molecular characteristics of intrahepatic LEL carcinomas warrant further study" should be better. - Typing errors: naso-pharyngeal (keywords)