

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14901

Title: Surgical outcomes of Korean ulcerative colitis patients with and without colitis-associated cancer

Reviewer's code: 00227403

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-29 20:00

Date reviewed: 2014-10-30 23:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the attached version I am not able to see figures and references, I hope that this is possible for the editor. The authors should reduce the number of the tables (table 4 could be deleted). The authors report that there is an increase of CRC in the last years. Is there possible to find two periods (between 1980 and July 2013) with a change in the management of UC or of the preventive strategy for CRC in patient with UC (for example less patients have been presented to the surgical treatment with advanced cancer)? The authors should describe this issue.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14901

Title: Surgical outcomes of Korean ulcerative colitis patients with and without colitis-associated cancer

Reviewer's code: 00035859

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-29 20:00

Date reviewed: 2014-11-19 00:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting multicenter study of the clinic-pathologic characteristics of patients with UC who underwent surgery. Hence the title needs to be suitably modified. The authors need to mention the total number patients with UC so that one can find the need for surgery in this group. The article especially the discussion needs to be shortened deleting unrelated discussion. Number of tables can be decreased.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14901

Title: Surgical outcomes of Korean ulcerative colitis patients with and without colitis-associated cancer

Reviewer's code: 00068316

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-29 20:00

Date reviewed: 2014-11-15 17:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "Surgical outcomes of colitis cancer in Korean patients with ulcerative colitis" described the clinico-pathologic characteristics of ulcerative colitis (UC) patients with surgical treatment and conducted comparison between surgically treated UC patients with colorectal cancer (CRC) with those without CRC. This is a well-written paper containing interesting results which merit publication.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14901

Title: Surgical outcomes of Korean ulcerative colitis patients with and without colitis-associated cancer

Reviewer's code: 00503405

Reviewer's country: Hungary

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-29 20:00

Date reviewed: 2014-11-17 01:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the original article of Yong Sik Yoon et al. the authors aimed to examine the effect of surgical treatment in UC and colitis-associated cancer. The title should be changed (see comment). The abstract is correct. The Introduction and Methodology parts are also correct. The results are clear, the published data has very important clinical merit. However, to point need revision. How were the included patients medically treated? Which medications were used as basic therapy as well as against active flares before colectomy? I advised to use colitis-associated cancer (even in the title) instead of CRC as the latter usually represents sporadic colorectal cancers with different pathobiology. English language needs minor polishing. After major revision I suggest to publish the manuscript in WJG.