ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 12614
Title: Association between cadherin 17 protein expression and pathological characteristics of gastric cancer: a meta-analysis
Reviewer code: 00506058
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2014-07-18 08:40
Date reviewed: 2014-07-31 14:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of	[ ] No records	publication
[ ] Grade D: Fair	language polishing	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Existing	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review is well written and deals with an important topic. The authors are advised to revise the manuscript for spelling and grammatical mistakes. Some examples are listed below: The result showed that CDH17 showed….please correct remains inconsistent, we therefore hypothesized that….should be divided into two sentences presented that high….. please correct among China…… please correct Gastric cancer (GC) is a malignant disease…..sure it is malignant is known as a multifactorial….. please correct A variety of risk factors…what about meat? Our study has some limitations that should be further confirmed for several reasons as follows….. please rewrite the sentence more clearly The first limitation in the current analysis may be that our study is….. please rewrite the sentence more clearly Our conclusions, however, need to be confirmed for the purpose of the limitations of the present analysis, and to the best combination of more larger sample size published, using a consistent definition for 'high' or 'low' expression on this topic, in future diagnosis and treatment of GC. ….. please rewrite the paragraph more clearly

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 12614
Title: Association between cadherin 17 protein expression and pathological characteristics of gastric cancer: a meta-analysis
Reviewer code: 00074961
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2014-07-18 08:40
Date reviewed: 2014-08-01 02:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of	[ ] No records	publication
[ ] Grade D: Fair	language polishing	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Existing	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

You should delete "mainly through integrin-Ras/Raf/MEK/ERK signaling" of the conclusion: this is not the objective of your study. It is important to know the reason of the high heterogeneity (all I2 test > 50 %). Could you hypothesize something more about this point different to gender, age and detection method? There is only a non-asian study, although with the large sample. Perhaps this should be mentioned in the text.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 12614
Title: Association between cadherin 17 protein expression and pathological characteristics of gastric cancer: a meta-analysis
Reviewer code: 00503536
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2014-07-18 08:40
Date reviewed: 2014-08-03 10:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of	[ ] No records	publication
[ ] Grade D: Fair	language polishing	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Existing	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript written by Fu et al. describes a meta-analysis for an association between cadherin 17 protein expression and the characteristics of gastric cancer. They found that cadherin 17 protein is associated with growth and metastasis of gastric cancer, suggesting a potential of targeted therapy against the protein. The analysis is interesting and important. However, there are some concerns that need to be addressed. Major point, It is not clear whether gastric cancers are clearly divided into CDH17-positive and CDH17-negative. Because cancer cells usually show heterogeneity, the same cut-off level of CDH17 expression should be used in all studies as the authors discuss, which could greatly affect the conclusion of this analysis. The protein usually diffusely expressed or focally expressed? Strongly CDH17-expressed cancer cells show more undifferentiated features than CDH17-negative cells? The authors should add more comments on those points. Minor point EnVision, PV LSAB, SP and ABC should be explained.