

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 13901

**Title:** Antiviral therapies for hepatitis B virus-related hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00032726

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-07 18:58

**Date reviewed:** 2014-09-22 10:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Chronic infection with HBV is the main cause of HCC and is associated with the unfortunate prognosis. Many studies have demonstrated that antiviral treatment with nucleos(t)ide analogues (NAs) or interferon- $\alpha$  (IFN- $\alpha$ ) can reduce HCC occurrence in chronic HBV-infected patients and improve survivals. This review showed plenty of evidence especially those indicating the fact that antiviral treatment could reduce the incidence and severity of potentially life-threatening HBV reactivation after conventional treatments. It will be useful for clinicians. Manuscript was well-written. However, there are several flaws should be addressed before further consideration. 1. This essay provided massive amount of data but there is no conclusion or discussion reflecting the opinion of authors. Benefits or limitations of antiviral treatment should be summarized at the end of the essay, drawn from restless study on various related literatures and references. Authors could make recommendations about administration or evaluation of antiviral drugs. 2. HBV mutation is the main cause of drug resistance and is the factor of HCC development. For example, YMDD mutation is due to the alternations on P region of HBV DNA and mutations on enhancer II/basal core promoter/precore (EnhII/BCP/PC) proven to be an independent risk of HCC. It is inevitable during



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

the discussion of specific antiviral treatment or improvement of evaluation methods. 3. A recent meta-analysis including 8 randomized controlled trials indicated that the effect of antiviral therapy on clinical outcomes of HBV-infected patients remains to be established.( Thiele M, et al. Antiviral therapy for prevention of hepatocellular carcinoma and mortality in chronic hepatitis B: systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMJ Open* 2013;3: e003265.) I wonder if authors could give some analysis about these outcomes which is in opposition to speculations.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 13901

**Title:** Antiviral therapies for hepatitis B virus-related hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00058198

**Reviewer's country:** Turkey

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-07 18:58

**Date reviewed:** 2014-09-21 07:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Editor

Thank you give me oppurtunity for review of this review article.

Relationship between HCC and HBV is a well known issue. In addition, the effect of antiviral treatment on both HCC development and HCC recurrence is well known issue. Many articles on this subject have been published in the literature. So this article is not to provide an additional contribution to the literature. However, some revisions should be made if the article can be suitable for publication.

1-Abstract section of the article was quite short. So, abstract should be rewritten

2- References is not used in a substantial part of the Introduction. According to me, a few references should be used.( Ffor example Ishikawa T. Anti-viral therapy to reduce recurrence and improve survival in hepatitis B virus-related hepatocellular carcinoma. World J Gastroenterol. 2013;19(47):8861-6.)



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

3-Author can make a literature review in this regard and the results of a literature review can be summarized in a table.

4-Author should be provide information about antiviral treatment in HCC patients who unwent liver transplantation.

5- I would like to review the article again after making these changes

With Best Wishes

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 13901

**Title:** Antiviral therapies for hepatitis B virus-related hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00068443

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-07 18:58

**Date reviewed:** 2014-09-30 16:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting overview of the literature related to the pathogenesis of HBV-related HCC and the antiviral treatments of HBV-related HCC after curative and palliative therapies. The paper is clearly written and contains valuable information. I would have expected a more extensive comment on the antiviral treatment and some conclusions from the literature. Benefits and limitations of the antiviral treatments are also the important issues of the topic.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 13901

**Title:** Antiviral therapies for hepatitis B virus-related hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00013175

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-07 18:58

**Date reviewed:** 2014-10-01 16:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors well summarized the efficacy of antiviral treatments for HBV-related hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC). This manuscript would provide useful information to the readers. However, I feel that tables summarizing the evidences would be more helpful for the readers. Moreover, conclusive comments or recommendations would be necessary.