

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 13949

**Title:** Diagnostic Performance of SPIO-enhanced MRI in Characterization of Focal Hepatic Lesions: A Systemic Review and Meta-analysis

**Reviewer code:** 02459013

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-10 13:31

**Date reviewed:** 2014-09-19 16:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, Li et al. evaluated the performance of superparamagnetic iron oxide (SPIO)-enhanced MRI in detection and characterization of focal hepatic lesions via systemic review and meta-analysis. The data showed that SPIO-enhanced MRI was useful for differential diagnosis between HCCs and other focal hepatic lesions. The study was well designed and the methods were accurately applied. I have only minor comments: 1. The search was limited because there are plenty of other electronic databases that could be searched like the Cochrane Library, Embase, Web of Science and Medline. 2. The author stated that "two reviewers screened the abstract of the selected articles independently". What about the strength of agreement between reviewers during article selection?

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 13949

**Title:** Diagnostic Performance of SPIO-enhanced MRI in Characterization of Focal Hepatic Lesions: A Systemic Review and Meta-analysis

**Reviewer code:** 02460781

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-10 13:31

**Date reviewed:** 2014-09-24 23:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article evaluated the performance of superparamagnetic iron oxide (SPIO)-enhanced MRI in detection and characterization of focal hepatic lesions via systemic review and meta-analysis. It was well designed and the methods were accurately applied. However, 1, SPIO-enhanced MRI has currently been considered to be the only imaging modality that is capable of distinguishing HCC from DN, although it is limited when both HCC and DN contain similar number of Kupffer cells. Based on the above, is the study necessary? 2 In this study, authors had not give the gold standard of diagnosis for hepatic lesions (HCC or focal hepatic lesions). 3 The search database was limited. It should include the other electronic databases such as the Cochrane Library, Embase, Web of Science and Medline.