



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13949

Title: Diagnostic Performance of SPIO-enhanced MRI in Characterization of Focal Hepatic Lesions: A Systemic Review and Meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 02459013

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-09-10 13:31

Date reviewed: 2014-09-19 16:11

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, Li et al. evaluated the performance of superparamagnetic iron oxide (SPIO)-enhanced MRI in detection and characterization of focal hepatic lesions via systemic review and meta-analysis. The data showed that SPIO-enhanced MRI was useful for differential diagnosis between HCCs and other focal hepatic lesions. The study was well designed and the methods were accurately applied. I have only minor comments: 1. The search was limited because there are plenty of other electronic databases that could be searched like the Cochrane Library, Embase, Web of Science and Medline. 2. The author stated that "two reviewers screened the abstract of the selected articles independently". What about the strength of agreement between reviewers during article selection?



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13949

Title: Diagnostic Performance of SPIO-enhanced MRI in Characterization of Focal Hepatic Lesions: A Systemic Review and Meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 02460781

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-09-10 13:31

Date reviewed: 2014-09-24 23:26

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article evaluated the performance of superparamagnetic iron oxide (SPIO)-enhanced MRI in detection and characterization of focal hepatic lesions via systemic review and meta-analysis. It was well designed and the methods were accurately applied. However, 1, SPIO-enhanced MRI has currently been considered to be the only imaging modality that is capable of distinguishing HCC from DN, although it is limited when both HCC and DN contain similar number of Kupffer cells. Based on the above, is the study necessary ? 2 In this study, authors had not give the gold standard of diagnosis for hepatic lesions (HCC or focal hepatic lesions). 3 The search database was limited. It should include the other electronic databases such as the Cochrane Library, Embase, Web of Science and Medline.