

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15555

Title: The role of ALPPS in colorectal liver metastases - a review

Reviewer's code: 01489938

Reviewer's country: Hungary

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-11-30 09:23

Date reviewed: 2014-12-07 22:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the metaanalysis of Hassel green et al. (The role of ALPPS in colorectal liver metastases) the authors aimed to review and summarize the recent results of ALPPS technique in CRC patients with liver involvement. They collect relevant articles and summarized all the available patient and technical information from these manuscripts. Though it is hard to make final conclusions based on the available data, the results and future perspectives are interesting and may represent the basis of future prospective studies. Are there any data about the combination of intervention radiologic methods like radio-frequent ablation (RFA) or percutaneous ethanol infiltration (PEI) with ALPPS. This aspect should also be discussed. After minor revision I suggest to accept the manuscript for publication.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15555

Title: The role of ALPPS in colorectal liver metastases - a review

Reviewer's code: 02445571

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-11-30 09:23

Date reviewed: 2014-12-26 23:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The contents of this review is new and interesting and will draw more reader's attention. It will be better to describe a little bit more details in the procedure of ALPPS. Acturally, the method may vary in different patients or centers, is there any indivadulized standards exist? What the indications for the second stage surgery? What they did in the first procedre and wait for how long to do the second step? Laproscopic or open surgery?