

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14789

Title: Tong Xie Yao Fang relieves irritable bowel syndrome in rats by mechanisms involving regulations of 5-hydroxytryptamine and substance P

Reviewer's code: 02483407

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-10-25 19:30

Date reviewed: 2014-10-31 02:31

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|--|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | PubMed Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

THIS IS AN IMPORTANT ISSUE. IRRITABLE BOWEL SYNDROME IS A COMMON DISEASE THAT IS ASSOCIATED TO NEGATIVE EVENTS. THE MANUSCRIPT IS VERY WELL WRITTEN AND THE ENGLISH SEEMS CORRECT. HOWEVER, SOME CAUTIONS THAT NEED TO BE REVIEWED. I SUGGEST AVOID SHORT NAME IN TITLE AND ABSTRACT; IN THE LAST PARAGRAPH OF INTRODUCTION: DELETE THE SENTENCE: "RAT MODEL OF IBS WAS DEVELOPED AND PRODUCED VISCERAL STIMULANTS THAT WERE USED AS HYPERSENSITIVITY POSITIVE CONTROLS". THIS TOPIC MUST BE DETAILED IN SECTION "METHODS". THE SENTENCE "THE MECHANISM OF ACTION ON RAT COLON TXYP MOTILITY AND THE REGULATION OF THE BRAIN=GUT AXIS WERE ALSO ANALYZED" REFERS TO PURPOSE, I BELIEVE. I THINK YOU MAY LEAVE IT LIGHTER. STILL IN THE LAST PARAGRAPH, PLEASE DELETE THE LAST SENTENCE: "IT IS CONCLUDED THAT TXYP IS A USEFUL THERAPY TO ALLEVIATE THE SYMPTOMS OF IBS". IN SECTION METHODS: WHAT IS THE TOTAL NUMBER OF ANIMALS? WHAT IS THE SPECIMEN? AFTER THE END OF THE



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

PROCEDURES, WHAT THE DESTINATION OF THE ANIMALS? IN THE SECOND PARAGRAPH OF SECTION "METHODS" THERE IS A SYMBOL LIKE A SQUARE PRECEDING THE WORD "ACTIN" WHAT NEEDS TO BE REEDITED HERE AND ALONG THE TEXT. IN CONCLUSION, I SUGGEST DELETE "AND THAT THESE HORMONES/NEUROTRANSMITTERS ARE INVOLVED IN THE DISEASE PATHOGENESIS OF IBS".

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14789

Title: Tong Xie Yao Fang relieves irritable bowel syndrome in rats by mechanisms involving regulations of 5-hydroxytryptamine and substance P

Reviewer's code: 00188388

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-10-25 19:30

Date reviewed: 2014-10-31 05:45

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | PubMed Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting study that deserves to be published. However, minor English language edits and edits for content are required to make the paper more easy to follow. Specific suggestions are: 1 - The abbreviations 5-HT and SP should be spelled out at their first occurrence in the paper, i.e. the abstract. 2 - The conclusion "and that these hormones/neurotransmitters are involved in the pathogenesis of IBS" is not warranted (since the authors only examine a model of IBS); this part of the last sentence in the abstract should be taken out. 3 - In the description of the IBS model, it is unclear to me why maternal separation is an essential part of the model. The way I understand the papers the authors use visceral hypersensitivity as a model for IBS. What does maternal separation have to do with IBS, either in rats or in humans? 4 - I could not understand the rationale for including a "positive" drug. This should be explained better. Please clarify the schedule on which the drugs were given. Daily? 5 - It would be very helpful to include a flowchart of the experimental design. I had trouble following what the different sub-groups of rats were, and it is not always clear how many rats were used in each experiment.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14789

Title: Tong Xie Yao Fang relieves irritable bowel syndrome in rats by mechanisms involving regulations of 5-hydroxytryptamine and substance P

Reviewer's code: 02438752

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-10-25 19:30

Date reviewed: 2014-11-05 11:31

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | PubMed Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| | | BPG Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Here are some problems which need to be modified. 1. The title The author only observed the changes in the expression of 5-HT and SP . They are only a very small part of Enteric Nervous System, so the title was not so appropriate. 2. The abstract The abstract describe the objective, the model , key results, and the conclusion. In the 'background' part, the authors describe the objective, not the background. The methods only include the model and the positive controls, there are no detective methods and the indexes description in the method part. Key results are not so clear in the abstract. There is no description about the background in the abstract. So, the author should rewrite the abstract and modified it's structure. 3. The material and methods About the rats: In the 'IBS model' part, all the rats were 8-day old, and after the model establishment, they are 21-day old. In the 'Animal groups and administration' part, the rats were 12-week old. Are they the same rats? Are the drugs were given after the rats model establishment and after they grew up to 12-week old, or the model was established and meanwhile treated? About the methods: Usually, β -actin was used as the reference for the protein expression in the western blotting methods, and GAPDH was used as the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

reference for the mRNA expression in RT-PCR. But in this research, the authors use GAPDH for western blotting and β -actin for RT-PCR. Are there any spelling mistake? Or did the authors do like this? 4. The statistical methods The authors use one-way ANOVA to compare the differences among the groups and post hoc were compared with SNK test. This method is used for data which are in accordance with normal distribution and homogeneity of variance. But the authors didn't describe whether the data are of normal distribution and homogeneity of variance. 5. The Discussion In this part, the authors review some researches before, and compared them with the present research. At the same time, the authors described the information about SP in the IBS research in detail, but the information about 5-HT is less. The authors should supplement information about 5-HT. And they are two independent neurotransmitter, what's the relationship of them? Why did the authors investigate these two indexes?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14789

Title: Tong Xie Yao Fang relieves irritable bowel syndrome in rats by mechanisms involving regulations of 5-hydroxytryptamine and substance P

Reviewer's code: 01557050

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-10-25 19:30

Date reviewed: 2014-11-09 10:05

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|--|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | PubMed Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) General comments Yin and Wang et al. described TXYF relieves IBS in rats by mechanisms involving regulation of enteric nervous system. The article is informative and well-presented. The reviewer has some comments. Comments 1. The authors should explain abbreviations such as SNK test in Statistics, and C-IBS, D-IBS, PI-IBS, PAR-2 in Discussion. Then, the authors should use an abbreviation of 'constipation predominant IBS' in Discussion.