

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15306

Title: CEB2 amplification and protein expression in mixed gastric carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00503571

Reviewer's country: Lithuania

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-11-21 14:23

Date reviewed: 2014-12-02 07:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors presented cohort study with 277 cases of mixed gastric carcinoma using 2 methods - fluorescence in situ hybridization (FISH) and Immunohistochemistry (IHC) to detect CEB2 amplification and protein expression. They also presented results of patients survival and progression free survival after small open non-randomised study with trastuzumab in CEB2 positive patients. The investigation likely represented the largest study on mixed type of gastric cancer in Chinese populations. However, the authors aim "to provide guidance for the targeted treatment on mixed gastric cancer" is too ambitious, because such guidelines are usually designed during Consensus meetings of experts. Other remarks: 1. In introduction a definition of ERBB2 should be better described, for example: Receptor tyrosine-protein kinase erbB-2, also known as CD340, proto-oncogene Neu, Erbb2 (rodent), or ERBB2 (human) is a protein that in humans is encoded by the ERBB2 gene, which is also frequently called HER2 (from human epidermal growth factor receptor 2) or HER2/neu. 2. Results: Table 5 could be omitted and the data could be included into text. 3. Some new literature sources should be added into discussion: Qiu M, et al ? Lauren classification combined with HER2 status is a better prognostic factor in Chinese gastric cancer

patients" BMC Cancer. 2014 Nov 7;14:823. doi: 10.1186/1471-2407-14-823. Qiu M et al concluded that HER2 status is a prognostic factor in diffuse and intestinal type patients, but not in the mixed type. It is in some controversy with results of the current study, which showed differences in prognosis and survival in ERBB2 positive patients treated or untreated by trastuzumab. 4. Authors should also to define the limitations of the study - non-randomised design of trastuzumab study in CERB2 positive patients. 5. The conclusions should be changed. The conclusion: "FISH is a reliable method for CERB2 detection in mixed gastric carcinoma" should be omitted because it is not a consequence of the study results. It is well-known from the literature that fluorescence in situ hybridisation (FISH) can be used to measure the number of copies of the gene which are present. So it could be concluded only that IHC is less specific method than FISH. The other conclusion statement "FISH should be considered as the gold-standard method" - is also well-know from literature, but not a result of the study. 6. Literature: "7. Wang Yangkun [M]// Gao Chunfang, learn Wang Yangkun gastric tumor pathology. Digestive oncology. Beijing: People's Medical Publishing House, 2012, 296-404" - should be corrected.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15306

Title: CERB2 amplification and protein expression in mixed gastric carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00503460

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-11-21 14:23

Date reviewed: 2014-12-04 19:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The references should be standardized as for year, volume and pages (some lack volume, number, or pages numbers and some have numbers between brackets).