

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13220

Title: Relationship between Helicobacter pylori Infection and Inflammatory Bowel Disease in Asian population: A Meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 02533618

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-08-12 19:21

Date reviewed: 2014-10-07 03:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title: Relationship between Helicobacter pylori Infection and Inflammatory Bowel Disease in Asian population: A Meta-analysis Following points should be revised: 1) Language should be checked. 2) The groups included into the meta-analysis are heterogeneous. Some of the methods in the manuscripts included into the meta-analysis investigated the previous infection (IgG detection) and the others determined the ongoing infection. Also there is little information about the antibiotics use. Only in the discussion there is an indication of "Two studies found that IBD patients with a history of taking antibiotics had a much lower H. pylori infection rate". Thus, in order to make a better discussion, the patient groups should be investigated in sub-groups, according to the H.pylori infection status, antibiotics use, IBD, UC and other inflammatory diseases states. Also, if available the diagnosis of H.pylori infection and other inflammatory diseases diagnosis order and the duration of the diseases should be indicated. If available the socio-economic status of the patients or at least the regions of the patients that were included into the study should be mentioned, as H.pylori infection is much more related to socio-economic status rather/more than ethnics. Tables indicating these sub-groups and discussion related to the mentioned points should be included into the manuscript.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13220

Title: Relationship between Helicobacter pylori Infection and Inflammatory Bowel Disease in Asian population: A Meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 02544637

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-08-12 19:21

Date reviewed: 2014-10-04 23:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well designed and performed meta-analysis. There are some questions: 1. Is there any ongoing clinical trial associated with this topic? 2. When you mention the controls, how many are there? 3. When you performed the search, why you chose "(antibiotics or antimicrobial) and (Crohn's disease) and (postoperative or surgery)" rather than the keywords of your article, such as "Helicobacter pylori; Inflammatory bowel disease; Asian population"? 4. Ten studies were included finally, but in the "Characteristics of included studies" you described that "Three studies used serologic tests (immunoglobulin G), eight studies used non-serologic tests (C-urea breath test, biopsy specimen histology, or biopsy sample culture), and three studies used a combination of methods"? Did that mean the three studies which used serologic tests are the same studies to these studies that used combination methods? 5. In the discussion, the description about possible mechanism of HP against IBD is too less. 6. The English of the article should be improved.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13220

Title: Relationship between Helicobacter pylori Infection and Inflammatory Bowel Disease in Asian population: A Meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 02456810

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-08-12 19:21

Date reviewed: 2014-09-29 02:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well designed and performed meta-analysis that confirms the results recently published for non-asian cohorts, Therresults are interesting and are worthy of publication