

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14896

Title: Glycyrrhizic acid inhibits apoptosis and fibrosis in CCl₄-induced rat liver injury

Reviewer's code: 01943107

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-29 19:38

Date reviewed: 2014-12-04 16:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript Guo et al evaluate the effects of glycyrrhizic acid (GA) on carbon tetrachloride (CCl₄)-induced hepatocyte apoptosis and liver fibrosis. The experimental procedures are well described and the manuscript need a minor editing revision. However, the data presented in the present study excessively overlaps those already published by the same authors (Ref 17). Therefore, this study lacks of novelty. The addition of in vitro data with silencing of specific apoptotic pathways and fibrogenic genes could be relevant to explain the actual molecular mechanism affected by GA. Furthermore, the quality of WB is poor and quantitative data of TUNEL are lacking.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14896

Title: Glycyrrhizic acid inhibits apoptosis and fibrosis in CCl₄-induced rat liver injury

Reviewer's code: 00187937

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-29 19:38

Date reviewed: 2014-11-18 15:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Editor, In this study authors have aimed to investigate how Glycyrrhizic acid (GA) exerted its anti-apoptotic effect against fibrosis in CCl₄-induced liver injury and its contributing factors. This study is well designed and presented, but I just want to offer a correct statistical analysis for the comparison of three groups. Authors have compared three groups consisting of 15 patients in each by one way ANOVA. As is known, ANOVA is used when parametric assumptions have been met. In the present study, since number of patients in each group is less than 30, parametric assumptions have not been met. Therefore, for comparisons, authors should use Kruskal Wallis Variance analysis for three groups and Mann Whitney U test for two groups. Sincerely.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14896

Title: Glycyrrhizic acid inhibits apoptosis and fibrosis in CCl₄-induced rat liver injury

Reviewer's code: 00003472

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-29 19:38

Date reviewed: 2014-12-11 17:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Guo et al. investigated the effects of glycyrrhizic acid in CCl₄-induced liver fibrosis. The results shown in the manuscript is interesting, and glycyrrhizic acid is a potential therapeutic agent for liver cirrhosis. However, additional data are required to strength the authors' conclusions. 1) CCl₄ is well known to induce necrosis as well as apoptosis. The authors should add comments regarding the effect of necrosis in Discussion. 2) Please add the data of serum transaminases in this model. 3) The authors mentioned CCl₄ was injected subcutaneously in CCl₄ group whereas CCl₄ was intraperitoneally injected in GA group. The authors should treat mice by same methods. In addition, a vehicle of CCl₄ is generally used oil but not water. Did authors mix CCl₄ and GA, and administrated simultaneously. If so, authors should rule out the possibility that GA does not reduce the toxic effect of CCl₄. 4) It is interesting whether glycyrrhizic acid directly inhibit an activation of stellate cells. How about the in vitro experiments using hepatic stellate cells? 5) Figure 6 is poor quality. In my eyes, GA rather promoted liver fibrosis. Demonstrable photos are required to strength authors' conclusion.