

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14596

Title: xpression of pyruvate dehydrogenase is an independent prognostic marker in gastric cancer patients after curative surgery

Reviewer's code: 02979303

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-10-15 15:06

Date reviewed: 2014-11-17 20:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The Authors have presented the prognostic role of PDH in gastric cancer. This is a meaningful analysis. There are several issues that the authors need to address. Major comment: 1、 The authors need to discuss better what the mechanism of its prognostic role in their analysis. 2、 There are some minor issues of language that that should be addressed

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14596

Title: xpression of pyruvate dehydrogenase is an independent prognostic marker in gastric cancer patients after curative surgery

Reviewer's code: 03009507

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-10-15 15:06

Date reviewed: 2014-11-27 13:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

the manuscript should be accepted after Minor revision

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14596

Title: xpression of pyruvate dehydrogenase is an independent prognostic marker in gastric cancer patients after curative surgery

Reviewer's code: 00503433

Reviewer's country: Iran

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-10-15 15:06

Date reviewed: 2014-12-09 11:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled: "Expression of pyruvate dehydrogenase is an independent prognostic marker in gastric cancer patients after curative surgery" has used IHC-TMA on paired tumoral and nontumoral tissue of 265 GC patients to demonstrate a prognostic role for the expression of Pyruvate Dehydrogenase (PDH). The study has been carefully performed and the obtained results are significant. Major Comments: 1. The figures and tables are vague. They should be simplified and include more descriptive legends to be presented as supporting evidence. 2. Authors have used western blotting of PDH on gastric cancer and noncancer cell lines. It is not clear how this analysis helps their argument. As the results were not mentioned in the abstract nor were they discussed. 3. The discussion should include a more elaborate description of the pertinent "state of the art" and how it relates to the authors' findings. Minor Comments 1. The methods used for statistical analysis should be clearly described for the tables to be better understood. 2. Every abbreviation should be described in full upon first usage. 3. Revision of the text by a native English speaker is highly recommended.