

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14455

Title: The inflammation-based scores predict survival for patients with HBV-related hepatocellular carcinoma after transarterial chemoembolization.

Reviewer code: 00013310

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-06 19:41

Date reviewed: 2014-10-19 15:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors compared six inflammation scores, TNM stage, CLIP score and BCLC stage as a prognostic factor for HBV related HCC patients treated by TACE. They concluded that GPS is superior to other inflammation scores and advocated a combined score of GPS and CLIP as a strong predictor of survival. The univariate analyses for survival were performed by log-rank test. Table 2 demonstrated the p values for univariate analysis. Log-rank test is usually compared two groups for survival. There were a lot of continuous variables such as WBC, and CRP. If they divided patients into two groups by setting a cut off value from a continuous variable and compared the two groups using log-rank test, the cut off value should be described in the table. If they compared each variable as continuous variable, the statistical method should be described in detail. The comparison of the AUC between inflammation scores and staging systems should give statistical differences of AUC between the scores. Otherwise, they could not conclude the superiority of GPS to other inflammation scores. From the survival curves for GPS scores, there were no differences between GPS1 and GPS2. The differences of survival were just determined by GPS0 and others. They compared CLIP and combined CLIP and GPS by AUC analysis as a predictor of survival. However, the strength of predictor of survival should be compared by hazard ratio of survival by cox proportional hazard model. The statistical method of this study is not appropriate. Therefore, the manuscript should be reconsidered especially in statistical analysis.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14455

Title: The inflammation-based scores predict survival for patients with HBV-related hepatocellular carcinoma after transarterial chemoembolization.

Reviewer code: 00182548

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-06 19:41

Date reviewed: 2014-10-19 00:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors made an interesting and useful study to improve the estimation of the prognosis in patients with HBV-related hepatocellular carcinoma after transarterial chemoembolization. The methodology, statistical analysis and results are made well. This a single center experience with some particularities regarding the patients, but the idea of combination between an inflammation-based prognostic score (GPS) and a staging system (CLIP score) can be tested in other future studies, too. There are some grammatical mistakes (from abstract to discussion) that should be corrected. In my opinion, the article is useful and deserves to be published.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14455

Title: The inflammation-based scores predict survival for patients with HBV-related hepatocellular carcinoma after transarterial chemoembolization.

Reviewer code: 00503516

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-06 19:41

Date reviewed: 2014-10-27 20:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dongsheng Zhou et al reported that the superior prognostic ability of GPS compared to other inflammation scores for patient with unresectable HBV-related HCC undergoing TACE; the author suggest that the combined use of GPS and CLIP can improve the prognostic power for OS. The work is clearly written and well conducted; the findings are however limited to HBV-HCC patients. Comments 1) The author should explain why only HBV-HCC patients have been considered. 2) There is a clear imbalance between male/female in the study: is there a specific reason for this? Can this aspect somehow influence the results? 3) Are there any relation between the age of the subjects and the outcome of the study? The ages of the subject are rather scattered can this affect the results?

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14455

Title: The inflammation-based scores predict survival for patients with HBV-related hepatocellular carcinoma after transarterial chemoembolization.

Reviewer code: 02730861

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-06 19:41

Date reviewed: 2014-11-02 13:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

For Authors: Hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) is one of the most common solid tumors worldwide, and the third leading cause of cancer-related deaths. Only 10-30% of HCCs are amenable to curative treatments including surgical resection, liver transplantation and local ablation, while transarterial chemoembolization (TACE) is considered to be the standard care for unresectable and unablatable HCCs, and shows survival benefit in selected patients. Therefore, it is important to select patients who would most likely benefit from TACE. There is increasing interest in the role of systemic inflammation as a predictor of outcome in HCC, and several inflammation scores were suggested to be useful as a predictor of outcome in HCC. However, which inflammation scores is more suitable for predicting outcome in patients with HBV-related HCC undergoing TACE has not been fully elucidated. The manuscript by Zhou D. et al. described the validation of the prognostic value of inflammation-based prognostic scores including the GPS, mGPS, NLR, PLR, PI, and PNI for patients with HBV-related HCC undergoing TACE, and also the validation of the combination of staging system and inflammation score to improve the prognostic power. They demonstrated that the GPS is superior to the other inflammation-based prognostic scores, and the combination of CLIP and GPS might improve the prognostic power. This paper is worth to be published in World Journal of Gastroenterology because it is innovative that the combination of CLIP and GPS might improve the prognostic power using ROC analyses. The authors need to describe about ROC and AUC



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

analyses which they used in more detail. In ROC analysis, the association between continuous data and outcome is usually investigated. However, the authors analysed the relation between several scores which are not continuous variables (GPS, mGPS, PI, combination score of the GPS and CLIP score) and outcome using ROC method. Also, there are some description which the authors should add or correct. Major compulsory revisions: 1. The authors need to describe in more detail regarding ROC and AUC analyses which they used to investigate the validation of the prognostic value of inflammation-based scores. 2. In Table 1, the authors should describe why they selected 3, 150, and 45 as the cut-off value in NLR, PLR and PNI, respectively. Minor essential revisions: 1. In page 3, in Abstract, the authors should add the description about platelet-lymphocyte ratio (PLR) in Purpose. 2. In page 15, line 2 and in page 17, line 17, "The GPS" should be corrected to "the GPS".