

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 15591

**Title:** The effect of peroral esophageal myotomy for achalasia treatment.

**Reviewer's code:** 03026624

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-11-29 22:14

**Date reviewed:** 2014-12-17 21:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, Lu et al., demonstrate that POEM can relieve achalasia symptoms, improve EGJ relaxation, and restore a certain degree of esophageal body motility function, however, it failed to restore normal esophageal peristalsis according to this retrospective study. Although it is well written, concerns were raised with regard to the lack of novelty when compared to the recent publications from China. This seems to be a study to confirm the safety and feasibility of POEM for patients with achalasia. Additionally, the panels of figures should be merged.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 15591

**Title:** The effect of peroral esophageal myotomy for achalasia treatment.

**Reviewer's code:** 03026540

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-11-29 22:14

**Date reviewed:** 2014-12-18 06:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dr Lu, congratulations on presenting your data on first 50 patients with achalasia treated with POEM. I have the following concerns: 1. The effect of POEM on achalasia is well know. More than 14 case series of patients treated with POEM are available for review. The largest case series reported data on 300 patients. 2. The title of the paper should reflect results of POEM in your center in first 50 patient. The current title is misleading. 3. There are numerous grammatical errors in the manuscript. I understand English may not be the first language of the authors. Please have the manuscript revised.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 15591

**Title:** The effect of peroral esophageal myotomy for achalasia treatment.

**Reviewer's code:** 02732254

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-11-29 22:14

**Date reviewed:** 2014-12-02 17:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Some tiny advise: 1.the pictures of POEM can combine figure 1 and figure 4 together, to show the effect of POEM more clearly. 2.The tables need more informations about the complication of PEOM although it didn't happen in this article.