

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15252

Title: Prevalence of fatty liver disease and economy in China: a systematic review

Reviewer's code: 00006552

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-11-18 15:24

Date reviewed: 2014-12-13 16:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review of published studies regarding prevalence of fatty liver disease based on economy development is valuable. For such a study, multicenter clinical collaboration should be undertaken; but simply review the data from previously publications. It is not clear what criteria were used to determine whether data from original studies included in this analysis were reliable. Due to no control of original studies in diagnosis standards, population base and the quality of original data, the results from such a meta-analysis are less valuable. Which original articles are included or not included for analysis will directly affect the final results.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15252

Title: Prevalence of fatty liver disease and economy in China: a systematic review

Reviewer's code: 00000456

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-11-18 15:24

Date reviewed: 2014-12-10 00:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

GENERAL COMMENT I enjoyed reading this article which, however, needs to be improved further.

SPECIFIC COMMENTS MAJOR Title – This is poorly informative. Consider rephrasing it to state the findings in a more doubtful shape. For instance: “Are fatty liver disorders (plural: alcoholic and nonalcoholic) a disease of affluence ? Evidence from.....” The main issues with this article (to be acknowledged as limitations) are that a) it does not differentiate alcoholic from nonalcoholic disease [but some Authors have highlighted that these 2 conditions are more similar than usually appreciated and that the distinction may not be as rational as usually thought (V?lzke H. Multicausality in fatty liver disease: is there a rationale to distinguish between alcoholic and non-alcoholic origin? World J Gastroenterol. 2012;18:3492-501. b) it offers no clue/insight/contribution as to the mechanisms linking affluence with fatty liver disorders. For instance: is there any evidence from literature data that increasing income is associated with specific lifestyle changes (in dietary habits or physical activity) ? c) Bibliographic references are mainly centered on NAFLD rather than on AFLD (Loria P Cardiovascular risk, lipidemic phenotype and steatosis. A comparative analysis of cirrhotic and non-cirrhotic liver disease due to varying etiology. Atherosclerosis. 2014;232:99-109.) Moreover, I

would suggest updating them. For instance, ref 4 should be changed with: J Hepatol. 2013;59:859-71. Ref 6 should be changed with Expert Rev Gastroenterol Hepatol. 2014;8:487-500. Ref 23 with: Amedeo Lonardo, Stefano Ballestri, Giulio Marchesini, Paul Angulo, Paola Loria Nonalcoholic fatty liver disease: A precursor of the metabolic syndrome. Digest Liver Dis 2014 IN PRESS MINOR a) "believed this study suggested a symbiotic correlation between the prevalence of FLD and economy, which may offer a novel epidemiologic perspective to the global situation of FLD." Further to not being idiomatic English, this sentence is particularly unclear. The adjective symbiotic is not particularly appropriate. The word "economy" is far too generic. "Global situation" is not an acceptable expression: what does it mean? b) Please compare epidemiologic features of NAFLD such as presented here with those on age and gender from recent review studies (World J Gastroenterol. 2014;20:14185-14204.) c) are there any previous studies from other areas of the world disclosing a connection of the increasing income with a surge in the prevalence of fatty liver disorders? d) Conversely, are there any reports disclosing an association between decreasing National incomes and decreasing prevalence of fatty liver disorders?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15252

Title: Prevalence of fatty liver disease and economy in China: a systematic review

Reviewer's code: 00199528

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-11-18 15:24

Date reviewed: 2014-12-18 23:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors evaluated association between prevalence of fatty liver diseases(FLD)and Gross domestic product(GDP)in China by using published articals from 2007 to 2014. then they make a projection for the prevalence of FLD in 2020 if GDP continues to increase steadily. my comments: *it should be emphasized at discussion that: -this type of retrospective studies can only show an association but does not implies a "causal effect". - Alcoholic liver disease and NAFLD were not separated and evaluated under umbrella of FLD. this is a weak point of the study that may lead bias. if it is possible, the data for the change in prevalenve of obesity and alcohol consumption at same period should be added. *Fig3: D,E and F should be omitted. *Fig4: A,B and C should be omitted. *Repeations of same ideas through the manuscript must be avoided

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15252

Title: Prevalence of fatty liver disease and economy in China: a systematic review

Reviewer's code: 00005855

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-11-18 15:24

Date reviewed: 2014-12-01 10:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors performed a systematic review of population-based surveys in order to explore the adult prevalence of fatty liver disease (FLD) in the mainland of China. They found the correlation between economy and the prevalence of FLD in the mainland of China. Their finding may be informative for the understanding of epidemiology of FLD. There are several issues and questions to be addressed.

Major

1. In this study, alcoholic liver disease cannot be separated from non-alcoholic fatty liver disease. However, it can be overcome by comparing the trend of total alcohol consumption over time.
2. In the discussion, the paragraphs starting with "The aging ..." seems to be just a review without associating with the current findings.
3. What is the definition of coastal and interior areas?

Minor

1. In the abstract, "at a rate of 0.594% per year" should be read as "at a rate of 0.594% increase per year".
2. In page 7, MOOSE needs reference.
3. Is the statement "Another study by Li et al.[25] suggested that the pooled prevalence of NAFLD in northern part of China is higher than in the southern, 18.21% and 21.87%, respectively." correct? It sounds like higher in the southern than in northern.
4. In Page 15 Line 4 from the bottom, do not repeat the results.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15252

Title: Prevalence of fatty liver disease and economy in China: a systematic review

Reviewer's code: 01136482

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-11-18 15:24

Date reviewed: 2014-12-05 17:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is very interesting and well written. The conclusion and the prospectives are a true trend of the metabolic profile in general and of liver steatosis in particular.