

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13165

Title: Association of IL-17 polymorphisms may be related with gastric cancer risk

Reviewer code: 02543990

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-08-09 18:52

Date reviewed: 2014-09-14 02:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Although environmental factors play roles in the etiology of gastric cancer (adenocarcinoma), only a fraction of the exposed develop the disease, suggesting a genetic susceptibility in the general population. It is likely that single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) located in gene promoter may cause differential gene expression, resulting in deregulated gene expression. In this manuscript, Liu D et al., extracted the published data to do meta-analysis of the relationship between the IL-17 gene polymorphisms and gastric cancer risk. They conclude that IL-17 rs2275913 and rs763780 polymorphisms are associated with increased susceptibility to gastric cancer. Overall, this is a very interesting study, the experiments are well designed and conducted, and the data are properly analyzed and presented, and the limitations of this study are also discussed. Thus, the result from this study may provide useful information in the field of IL-17 in gastric cancer. No significant flaws are noticed. It is suggested to revise the manuscript to get it more concise.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13165

Title: Association of IL-17 polymorphisms may be related with gastric cancer risk

Reviewer code: 00069023

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-08-09 18:52

Date reviewed: 2014-08-20 14:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article 'Association of IL -17 polymorphisms may be related with gastric cancer risk.' by D. Liu et al. is an original article to elucidate the relationship between the IL-17 gene and gastric cancer risk, especially those carried with rs2275913 G>A and rs763780 T>C polymorphisms. The authors systematically reviewed published studies on IL-17 polymorphisms with gastric cancer risk in the current literatures and seven case-control studies met the inclusion criteria. The IL-17 gene polymorphisms might be important in determining an individual's susceptibility to gastric cancer after a meta-analysis method. The results of this manuscript are important to readers that gastric cancer is related to gene molecular variation. But there are some points that the authors need to clarify: Major point: 1. These participated subjects of seven case-control studies are confined to Asian people (4 Chinese populations, 2 Japanese populations and 1 Iranian population) rather than those in the world. The reviewer hopes the authors describe this point in title and abstract. 2. The authors need to review the accurate populations involved this study, because it will affect the final results. The accurate populations are 4 Chinese populations (ref. 7, 24, 31 and 32), 2 Japanese populations (ref. 21 and 30) and 1 Iranian population (ref.8) rather than 5 Chinese, 1 Japanese and 1 Iranian population listed in Page 7, Line 13-14. Minor point: 1. Please correct the accurate reference behind the author listed in Table 1.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13165

Title: Association of IL-17 polymorphisms may be related with gastric cancer risk

Reviewer code: 00181101

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-08-09 18:52

Date reviewed: 2014-09-10 01:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting collection and meta-analysis of data on the risk of gastric cancer associated with IL17 genes polymorphisms. Gathered data and statistical analyses seem to be comprehensive and detailed, however authors should discuss more on the 'functional' effect of investigated polymorphisms, as in part it is addressed in the discussion section (page 9, last sentence). If the scientific hypothesis is that certain IL17 genetic variants predispose to enhanced inflammation and hence to increased risk of inflammation-related cancer (such as Hp-related gastric cancer), then authors should search for evidence of increased expression and function of IL17 axis and IL17-driven inflammatory response associated with rs2275913A and rs763780C alleles (in presence and absence of Hp infection). If these data are not available they should at least discuss on the need for future experimental models investigating functional effects of IL17 gene polymorphisms and how these studies should be designed in preclinical and clinical settings