

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15907

Title: miR-451 Inhibits Proliferation of Esophageal Carcinoma Cell Line EC9706 by Targeting CDKN2D and MAP3K1

Reviewer's code: 00753027

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-12-16 15:05

Date reviewed: 2014-12-24 09:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reported their findings on the roles of miR-451 in proliferation of esophageal carcinoma cell line EC9706 by targeting CDKN2D and MAP3K1. Based on the results showing inconsistency between CDKN2D and MAP3K1, the authors should not ignore the findings. The provided evidence could not fully support the conclusion.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15907

Title: miR-451 Inhibits Proliferation of Esophageal Carcinoma Cell Line EC9706 by Targeting CDKN2D and MAP3K1

Reviewer's code: 01213174

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-12-16 15:05

Date reviewed: 2014-12-25 14:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

GENERAL This is an in vitro study that addressed the mechanism of tumor suppressive functions of a microRNA, miR-451. The authors authentically conducted the required experiments using esophageal cancer cells and revealed that miR-451 targeted CDKN2D and MAP3K1 and worked tumor-suppressively through the inhibition of the two kinases. The findings are expected to contribute to the development of molecularly targeted therapy for esophageal cancer. This reviewer thinks the manuscript is potentially worth publishing in World Journal Gastroenterology after major revisions are made. **SPECIFIC** In the present study, authors used EC9706 cells only. This reviewer has a question whether the findings shown by the experiments in this study were applicable to many cancer cells of the esophagus or specific for EC9706 cells? The authors should show the results of Fig. 1 using a different cancer cell line that is originated from human esophageal cancer cells.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15907

Title: miR-451 Inhibits Proliferation of Esophageal Carcinoma Cell Line EC9706 by Targeting CDKN2D and MAP3K1

Reviewer's code: 00724342

Reviewer's country: Serbia

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-12-16 15:05

Date reviewed: 2015-01-03 00:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is basically good. The authors have done designed and guided the study. But what is confusing is that the authors have declared that no competing interest exists, on one side and this study was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (81272188; 81301726) on the other side. One of the important fact in the Conflict of Interest Disclosure Statement is research funding! In this manuscript, there is no strong evidence that the authors have no conflict of interest. Therefore, it is necessary to obtain statements of the author prior to publication in WJG