

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14782

Title: The association of type 2 diabetes mellitus and the risk of colorectal cancer; a meta analysis and systematic review

Reviewer code: 02572232

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-10-26 11:22

Date reviewed: 2014-10-29 21:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1、Data retrieval is from Medline, EMBASE, Cochrane Library, and ISI Web of knowledge databases, but in Figure 1 it is only from PubMed? 2、Is it accurate that 'CRC is the second leading cause of cancer-related deaths world-wide and New onset of DM is invariably considered as a marker of occult cancer, or of progression of a known disease'? 3、Is there an offset error that obesity maybe affect the onset risk both DM and CRC?

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14782

Title: The association of type 2 diabetes mellitus and the risk of colorectal cancer; a meta analysis and systematic review

Reviewer code: 02459162

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-10-26 11:22

Date reviewed: 2014-10-26 21:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

in my opinion very good piece of work - methodology well done systematic review performed well; language very good. Topic of the review is important and innovative.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14782

Title: The association of type 2 diabetes mellitus and the risk of colorectal cancer; a meta analysis and systematic review

Reviewer code: 02948135

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-10-26 11:22

Date reviewed: 2014-10-27 05:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Author, This is a meta analysis & systematic review for association of CRC with DM. 1. Please explain why you have excluded the 32 case-control studies. 2. How to prove your statement 'DM was associated with an increased risk (RR; 1.40; 95% CI: 1.20-1.63) for death from CRC.' The argument is the increased mortality among diabetic patients is actually due to diabetic complications rather than CRC per se. Please provide clear view. 3. The statement 'New onset of DM is invariably considered as a marker of occult cancer, or of progression of a known disease (reverse causality: diabetes is a consequence of cancer) (28)' This is very strong statement, new onset DM is not always indicate occult cancer or progression of cancer. It may indicate pancreatic cancer however. But this is not the case in every patient. 4. The statement of 'CRC risk increased in diabetic men, but not women, before DM onset' is not clear and doesn't make sense. Please explain or re-phrase. 5. Other important studies are not included, as example: 1. P.T. Campbell, E.T. Jacobs, C.M. Ulrich, J.C. Figueiredo, J.N. Poynter, J.R. McLaughlin, R.W. Haile, E.J. Jacobs, P.A. Newcomb, J.D. Potter, L. Le Marchand, R.C. Green, P. Parfrey, H.B. Younghusband, M. Cotterchio, S. Gallinger, M.A. Jenkins, J.L. Hopper, J.A. Baron, S.N. Thibodeau, N.M. Lindor, P.J. Limburg, M.E. Martinez, for the Colon Cancer Family Registry. (2010) Case-control study of obesity, overweight and colorectal cancer risk, overall and by tumor microsatellite instability status. Journal of the National Cancer Institute, 102 (6): 391-400. PMID: 20208017. 2. P.T. Campbell, C.C. Newton, A.N. Dehal, E.J. Jacobs, A.V. Patel, S.M. Gapstur. (2012)

Impact of body mass index on survival after colorectal cancer diagnosis: the Cancer Prevention Study-II Nutrition Cohort. *Journal of Clinical Oncology*, 30 (1): 42-52. PMID: 22124093 A.N. Dehal, C.C. Newton, E.J. Jacobs, A.V. Patel, S.M. Gapstur, 3.P.T. Campbell. (2012) Impact of diabetes mellitus and insulin-use on survival after colorectal cancer diagnosis: the Cancer Prevention Study-II Nutrition Cohort. *Journal of Clinical Oncology*, 30 (1): 53-59. PMID: 22124092 Other studies that are related as well before 2010:1 Will JC, Galuska DA, Vinicor F, Calle EE. Colorectal cancer: another complication of diabetes mellitus? *Am J Epidemiol* 1998;147:816-25. 2 Hu FB, Manson JE, Liu S, Hunter D, Colditz GA, Michels KB, et al. Prospective study of adult onset diabetes mellitus (type 2) and risk of colorectal cancer in women. *J Natl Cancer Inst* 1999;91:542-7. 3 Limburg PJ, Anderson KE, Johnson TW, Jacobs DR Jr, Lazovich D, Hong CP, et al. Diabetes mellitus and subsite-specific colorectal cancer risks in the Iowa women's health study. *Cancer Epidemiol Biomarkers Prev* 2005; 14:133-7. 4 Khaw KT, Wareham N, Bingham S, Luben R, Welch A, Day N. Preliminary communication: glycated hemoglobin, diabetes, and incident colorectal cancer in men and women: a prospective analysis from the European prospective investigation into cancer-Norfolk study. *Cancer Epidemiol Biomarkers Prev* 2004;13:915-9. 5 Dawson SI. Long-term risk of malignant neoplasm associated with gestational glucose intolerance. *Cancer* 2004;100:149-55. 6 Coughlin SS, Calle EE, Teras LR, Petrelli J, Thun MJ. Diabetes mellitus as a predictor of cancer mortality in a large cohort of US adults. *Am J Epidemiol* 2004;159:1160-7. 7 Meyerhardt JA, Catalano PJ, Haller DG, Mayer RJ, Macdonald JS, Benson AB 3rd, et al. Impact of diabetes mellitus on outcomes in patients with colon cancer. *J Clin Oncol* 2003;21:433-40. 8 Renehan AG, Zwahlen M, Minder C, O'Dwyer ST, Shalet SM, Egger M. Insulin-like growth factor (IGF)-I, IGF binding protein-3, and cancer risk: systematic review and meta-regression analysis. *Lancet* 2004;363: 1346-53. 9 Wu Y, Yakar S, Zhao L, Hennighausen L, LeRoith D. Circulating insulin-like growth factor-I levels regulate colon cancer growth and metastasis. *Cancer Res* 2002;62:1030-5. 10 Ma J, Giovannucci