

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10357

Title: Aberrant EphB/ephrin-B expression in experimental gastric lesions and tumor cells

Reviewer code: 02905032

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-03-28 09:29

Date reviewed: 2014-05-04 19:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Uchiyama and colleagues investigated the changes in expression levels of EphB receptor and ephrin-B ligand in a rat model of experimental gastric lesions. In addition, they analyzed the expression of these genes in gastric cancer cell lines by RT-PCR. Although this manuscript is nicely written and the topic of interest, I have some mayor concerns: 1. It is old fashioned to quantify mRNA expression levels by densitometry. In addition, there exists more sensitive methods like quantitative RT-PCR, that are now commenly available. Authors have to confirm all the PCR data by repeating the experiments with qPCR (Figures 1, 3 and 8). 2. How are the changes in the expression patterns of EphB/ephrin B during dysplastic/oncogenic transformation in human gastric mucosa? This issue is extremly important and might underline the reliability of the rat model. It would be easy to perform immunohistochemistry of human gastric tissue samples of gastric ulcer, dysplasia and cancer. It is impossible to compare the expression levels of EphB/ephrin B in rat gastric mucosa with the expression levels in human gastric cancer cell lines. Thus, the authors conclusions regarding the changes in EpHB/ephrin B expression during oncogenic tissue transformation are insubstantial. Taken together, the paper is missing important information to support their conclusions. Thus, in this version this manuscript is unacceptable for publication

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10357

Title: Aberrant EphB/ephrin-B expression in experimental gastric lesions and tumor cells

Reviewer code: 53723

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-03-28 09:29

Date reviewed: 2014-05-8 08:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a potentially interesting study; however, several aspects have to clarified before the paper be considered appropriate for publication.

First, data presentation must be clear and a table containing the comparative results between NORMAL and HYPERPLASIC stomachs must be provided. This table must contain the type of cells (region) and the level of expression of ephs and ephrins isoforms. The quality of slides presented in figure 1, 4-6 is poor. In fact, the figure 7 is not clear to me because the co-expression of ephB isoforms and ephrinB isoforms varied.

To support "...based on these findings, it is proposed that the stable and robust upregulation of coexpressed EphB and ephrin-B is a marker of dysplastic/oncogenic transformation..." a more quantitative or semi-quantitative table must be presented (see above).

The final sentence is too strong and the presented data give only a hard indication of the statement: "These results can be useful for the early and accurate diagnosis of gastric tumors for the timely initiation of "therapeutic interventions. " Thus, change the sentence to be more conservative and indicate that the data is still preliminary, but may be indicating what authors proposed.

minor aspects

In page 10, change ... EphB2-B4 ... to EphB2 and EphB4. Otherwise, it can give the impression that EphB3 is also being expressed (and just before, it stated that this isoform is not expressed).

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10357

Title: Aberrant EphB/ephrin-B expression in experimental gastric lesions and tumor cells

Reviewer code: 02457053

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-03-28 09:29

Date reviewed: 2014-05-20 08:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

For mRNA analysis, figure of internal control should be shown in the result.