

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10695

Title: Therapeutic effects of butein in IL-10-/- mice colitis and its impact on the IL-6/STAT3 pathway

Reviewer code: 00503404

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-04-15 16:03

Date reviewed: 2014-05-02 14:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting paper assessing the immunomodulatory effect of butein in experimental colitis. Comments; 1. The research methodology is acceptable, but authors should add animal numbers per group and provide some numeric data in the text. A 5 animal per group is barely acceptable (a minimum of 7 animals is the limit for statistical analysis), thus please confirm that there were repeated experiments with similar results. 2. Have authors also assessed clinical outcomes, like colon length or animal weight. This is again essential for proving a clinical efficacy. 3. Authors should also study other animal models (e.g. DSS colitis) to prove a beneficial effect in different settings.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10695

Title: Therapeutic effects of butein in IL-10^{-/-} mice colitis and its impact on the IL-6/STAT3 pathway

Reviewer code: 00051081

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-04-15 16:03

Date reviewed: 2014-05-03 02:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Piroxicam-accelerated colitis in IL-10^{-/-} rodent model is a relatively new but reliable model of Crohn's disease. The authors have tested a new plant polyphenol-butein in this model to test whether butein will cause any amelioration or not. There are methodological and technical shortcomings but despite these I believe this study is original and deserves to be published due its original idea and interesting findings.