

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16018

Title: Integrative analysis of the aberrant wnt signaling pathway in HBV-related HCC

Reviewer's code: 03011315

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-12-22 21:22

Date reviewed: 2015-01-07 22:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Introduction: The aim of the study is not clear. Material and methods: It is not clear if the study is retrospective or prospective. The authors declared: "The study was approved by the Ethics Committee in the university, and the informed consents were obtained from all patients and donors before the start of the study." But that sentence is in contrast with the declaration in the "Academic rules and norms" sent to the Editor. No statistical analysis chapter is described. Results: The authors wrote: "As shown in Figure1B, the CTNNB1 mutation rate in chronic HBV-related HCC was 10.79%, which was similar to that in HBV/HCV co-infection related HCC, but significantly lower than those with HCV-related HCC or non-viral HCC. Even though, the CTNNB1 mutation rate in chronic HBV-related HCC was still higher than that in several other human tumors like ESCC, lung cancer and gastric cancer." and again: "...the CTNNB1 mutation rate in HCC is 19.24%, which was significantly higher than the mutation rates in other tumors..." - and again: "the CTNNB1 mutation rate in chronic HBV-related HCC was 10.79%, which was similar to that in HBV/HCV co-infection related HCC, but significantly lower than those with HCV-related HCC or non-viral HCC" If the authors wrote "significantly higher" or "significantly lower" a statistical analysis is important to do



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Tables: Please substitute "?" with NA (Not Available) Discussion No comments



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16018

Title: Integrative analysis of the aberrant wnt signaling pathway in HBV-related HCC

Reviewer's code: 00742223

Reviewer's country: Argentina

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-12-22 21:22

Date reviewed: 2014-12-29 22:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a comprehensive study. The methodology is correct. The conclusions are consistent with the results obtained. Represents a significant contribution in the advancement of study of the process of hepatocarcinogenesis. The only shortcoming is that the report of patient consent is not present.