

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15779

Title: Treatment of hepatic and peritoneal metastasized carcinoma in the tail of the pancreas with neoadjuvant FOLFIRINOX therapy and R0 resection in two patients

Reviewer's code: 00053950

Reviewer's country: Finland

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-09 10:30

Date reviewed: 2015-01-07 19:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors describe two patient cases of pancreatic cancer with liver metastases. After neoadjuvant chemotherapy with FOLFIRINOX R0 resection was performed. Sixteen and 18 months after starting the treatment the patients are alive, but one of them have experienced recurrence. The results of FOLFIRINOX have been encouraging in the treatment of advanced pancreatic cancer. Conroy et al. presented the results of phase III study 2011 in NEJM. Median OS was 11.1 months compared to 6.8 months with gemcitabine-based treatment. Thus, it is not surprising that the authors have reached in such good results with their aggressive treatment in these two patients. There are also other small studies and case reports showing R0 resections in advanced pancreatic cancers with neoadjuvant FOLFIRINOX. In the present cases liver was resected for metastases as well. Remarks: - Are the authors absolutely certain that the areas of the metastases have been resected, as these were not visible during the operation? - It is common with liver metastases of colorectal cancer to achieve so called complete response with neoadjuvant chemotherapy. However, a thorough histologic examination often reveals residual cancer cells in those treated scarred areas. In addition, a negative



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

histologic result may not mean that there are no malignant cells in the treated area. I would figure that the same phenomenon may be seen with pancreatic cancer metastases as well. - It may be not surprising to have 1.5 yrs survival after FOLFIRINOX therapy and aggressive surgery. It would be by far more interesting to see the survival benefit with a longer follow-up. - In Fig 1. the postoperative CT section (G) is from a markedly lower level than in sections C-F. Why is that? The extension or the area of liver resection cannot be seen in this CT-section. The section should be from the level of portal bifurcation and just above the upper pole of the kidneys. - Fig 2. It is again hard to find out what kind of resection has been made. The configuration of the liver in section G looks identical to preoperative sections (D-F). - It would be interesting to know the size of liver resected in both cases. - Discussion. The OS should be presented from the beginning of the treatment not from the time of diagnosis.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15779

Title: Treatment of hepatic and peritoneal metastasized carcinoma in the tail of the pancreas with neoadjuvant FOLFIRINOX therapy and R0 resection in two patients

Reviewer's code: 00068891

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-09 10:30

Date reviewed: 2015-01-08 09:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author reported 2 cases of hepatic pancreatic carcinoma, which became resectable after neoadjuvant treatment named FOLFIRINOX. The result is encouraging and further clinical studies are needed to verify the efficacy and to observe the toxicities of the schemes in large population of the patients.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15779

Title: Treatment of hepatic and peritoneal metastasized carcinoma in the tail of the pancreas with neoadjuvant FOLFIRINOX therapy and R0 resection in two patients

Reviewer's code: 00054523

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-09 10:30

Date reviewed: 2015-01-06 07:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a case report of two cases of long-term survival of metastatic pancreatic cancer after therapy with FOLFIRINOX. One patient however developed a lymph node metastasis 20 month after the initial diagnosis. Major comment: These cases are interesting (for example both were cancers of the tail of the pancreas and were CA 19-9 negative at diagnosis) and the report is well written. However I am not sure if these two cases are just outliers and we may not be able to learn why these patients specifically survived. For example the original study describing FOLFIRINOX therapy had 2 patients (of 171) who received FOLFIRINOX who were still alive after 42 months. In the same study one patient had progression-free survival up to 24 months. We must therefore conclude that occasional, rare cases of survival may occur. Minor concerns: - Please provide a better time-line of the patients course, maybe as a table to illustrate the course and overall duration of survival. - The case description could be shortened. - Do you have more details about the histology of the tumors? This may help understand what makes these patients different to the majority of non-survivors.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15779

Title: Treatment of hepatic and peritoneal metastasized carcinoma in the tail of the pancreas with neoadjuvant FOLFIRINOX therapy and R0 resection in two patients

Reviewer's code: 00068107

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-09 10:30

Date reviewed: 2015-01-03 18:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Further studies should be required to examine the role of FOLFIRINOX as neoadjuvant treatment option in the patients with hepatic metastatic pancreatic carcinoma in the head of the pancreas, so as to evaluate the influence of tumor localization to the effectiveness of chemotherapy.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15779

Title: Treatment of hepatic and peritoneal metastasized carcinoma in the tail of the pancreas with neoadjuvant FOLFIRINOX therapy and R0 resection in two patients

Reviewer's code: 00069023

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-09 10:30

Date reviewed: 2015-01-04 09:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors report two patients with hepatic metastases, complete remission of their metastases in response to FOLFIRINOX and subsequently underwent curative intended R0 resection of the tumor located in the tail of pancreas. The result is promising for the metastasized pancreatic cancer patients, poor prognosis with traditional therapy.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15779

Title: Treatment of hepatic and peritoneal metastasized carcinoma in the tail of the pancreas with neoadjuvant FOLFIRINOX therapy and R0 resection in two patients

Reviewer's code: 00068443

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-09 10:30

Date reviewed: 2015-01-04 15:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors report two patients with metastatic pancreatic cancer. Both patients showed complete remission of their metastases in response to FOLFIRINOX and subsequently underwent curative intended R0 resection of their primaries located in the tail of pancreas. The paper is clearly written and well orgnized. 1. The 3rd paragraph in DISCUSSION "There is one case published currently,": the reference is better to be cited. 2.present the histopathologic images of two cases.