BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 15049
Title: Citrin deficiency presenting as acute liver failure triggered by infection in apparently well late infant
Reviewer's code: 02440657
Reviewer's country: China
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2014-11-07 14:28
Date reviewed: 2014-12-30 12:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript present a rare clinical case of citrin deficiency infant, which caused acute liver failure triggered by infection. The information is quite inclusive, the analysis is reasonable, and the case could give clinicians reminding in the practice. The case is unique since citrin deficiency developed at late infancy, actually, there's more than one report that mentioned citrin deficiency in the literature, the author might need to compare the case with the others in discussion section, thus to better demonstrate their own case; There are quite a lot grammar errors in the context, eg,"in Japanese" might be "in Japan", "failure to" might be "fail to" etc, which need to be carefully checked.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 15049
Title: Citrin deficiency presenting as acute liver failure triggered by infection in apparently well late infant
Reviewer's code: 02937613
Reviewer's country: Canada
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2014-11-07 14:28
Date reviewed: 2014-11-15 07:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[Y] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I found the language difficult to follow. The manuscript core tip sounded like you are claiming to report the first case of liver failure in late infancy among citrin deficient neonates. This is not the first report (J Inherit Metab Dis. 2010 Dec;33 Suppl 3:S489-95. doi: 10.1007/s10545-010-9248-6). If it is rare then this should be referenced. I think the core tip is that an infection may trigger (or exacerbate) a citrin deficiency syndrome resulting in liver failure. A case of citrin deficiency which progressed liver failure in an infant who developed a cough has been reported (J Inherit Metab Dis. 2010 Dec;33 Suppl 3:S489-95. doi: 10.1007/s10545-010-9248-6). It would be relevant cite and perhaps discuss this.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 15049
Title: Citrin deficiency presenting as acute liver failure triggered by infection in apparently well late infant
Reviewer's code: 02944212
Reviewer's country: China
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2014-11-07 14:28
Date reviewed: 2014-11-09 23:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	[Y] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

NICCD usually presents before three months after birth with jaundice, discolored stools, hepatosplenomegaly and coagulopathy.but this case of NICCD suffered liver failure triggered by bronchial pneumonia at 8 months of age.This report wrote the case in details including management and mutation identification.