

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16060

Title: The impact of muscle wasting on survival in patients with liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 02941980

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-12-25 10:25

Date reviewed: 2015-01-04 11:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article "The impact of muscle wasting on survival in patients with liver cirrhosis" shows that muscle wasting is a common complication of cirrhosis, its prevalence increases as the disease progresses, and it is associated with diminished survival in patients with liver cirrhosis and hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC). However, they are not without their limitations in the management of muscle wasting. Such as the high cost of CT or MRI, lack of patients' compliance, difficulty in accessing dietary guidance, absence of both accurate and easy-to-use tools for longitudinal assessments of muscle size and lack of prospective or randomized controlled trial. Overall, the paper is well written and sound, and provide a new method to predict survival of patients with cirrhosis; but there are still some problems need to be revised. Minor: 1. All acronyms should be defined at their first appearance in the manuscript. Such as "magnetic resonance imaging (MRI)" in the abstract. 2. There are also a lot of writing mistakes. e.g. page 3 line 2 and 5 "by a European consensus[1]" should be "by a European consensus [1]", a lot of blanks were lost in the manuscript

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16060

Title: The impact of muscle wasting on survival in patients with liver cirrhosis

Reviewer's code: 02942666

Reviewer's country: Pakistan

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-12-25 10:25

Date reviewed: 2015-02-13 22:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Reviewer comments General comments: This editorial has highlighted the importance of muscle wasting in patients with liver cirrhosis. Authors discussed the various studies showing impact of muscle wasting among cirrhotics' both pre and post transplant mortality. Specific comments: Title: Reflects accurately the content of the study. Abstract: The conclusion section of abstract should be rephrased thus reflecting the title. Other suggestions: 1. Authors should clearly define the terms sarcopenia, hepatic cachexia and malnutrition rendering it understandable and clear to reader. 2. The underlying mechanism of sarcopenia with reference to molecular aspects should be added. 3. Authors should also include obese cirrhotics and ageing cirrhotic in their discussion with reference to muscle wasting/sarcopenia. As defining sarcopenia in the obese cirrhotic is very crucial to understand the subject. 4. The reduced muscle mass/ sarcopenia is not always the same in all aetiologies of cirrhosis of liver. Authors should discuss the reduced muscle mass with various aetiologies of cirrhosis as well. 5. Authors should discuss the role of nutraceuticals in sarcopenia of cirrhosis of liver.