

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15819

Title: Risk factors for complications associated with upper gastrointestinal foreign bodies

Reviewer's code: 02983875

Reviewer's country: Norway

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-11 15:00

Date reviewed: 2015-01-29 04:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Although retrospective as noted in the discussion, this article aids the clinician in decision making. The article is well written and the message is clear. I would however like to see some more detail on the patients who went to surgery - what complication and what was done? What kind of objects were impacted and how long were they impacted etc. A table maybe?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15819

Title: Risk factors for complications associated with upper gastrointestinal foreign bodies

Reviewer's code: 00503621

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-11 15:00

Date reviewed: 2015-01-20 04:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

appropriately written. no major concerns.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15819

Title: Risk factors for complications associated with upper gastrointestinal foreign bodies

Reviewer's code: 02570386

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-11 15:00

Date reviewed: 2014-12-18 13:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I am pleased to inform you that manuscript has been acceptable for publication in this journal, after peer-reviewing to secure excellence in scientific quality and presentation.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15819

Title: Risk factors for complications associated with upper gastrointestinal foreign bodies

Reviewer's code: 00050420

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-12-11 15:00

Date reviewed: 2015-01-22 09:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Review about ESPS Manuscript NO: 15819 The author reported 'Risk factors for complications associated with upper gastrointestinal foreign bodies'. Foreign bodies in the esophagus or stomach are very common. They appear to be associated with fewer complications. But major complications carry significant morbidity and surgical intervention. It is very important to assess the factors associated with major complications. Therefore these findings are important to those with closely related research interests. But there are some problems in this manuscript. Firstly the abstract was not summarized, especially 'method' section. The state of impaction of foreign bodies is very important. But how do authors confirm the state of impaction. The definition of impaction of foreign is necessary. Many authors use the time of ingestion or the duration of foreign bodies in the esophagus. In 'Result', The median age at diagnosis was 54.84±18.03 (range, 10 89) years. ? The mean age at diagnosis was 54.8±18.0 (range, 10 89) years. Females (105/194, 54.1%) outnumbered males. ? There were 105 (54.1%) females and 89 (45.9%) male patients. Clinical features of foreign bodies ? Characteristics and location of foreign bodies approximately 1 to 383 h ? approximately 1



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

to 383 hours. In 'Discussion', A 'normal' X-ray ? normal finding in radiography. The tables should be revised. Which group does 60 years old patient belong to, 'above 60' or 'below 60'? The quality of language in the manuscript is not suitable for publication unless edited. Reviewer is unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the minor compulsory revisions.