



**ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 16158

**Title:** Efficacy of 14 versus 7 days of bismuth-based quadruple therapy as second-line eradication treatment of Helicobacter pylori infection in Korea

**Reviewer’s code:** 00503623

**Reviewer’s country:** United States

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2015-01-01 12:27

**Date reviewed:** 2015-01-03 00:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The study, conducted with 790 patients who failed PPI-based Hp eradication treatment, reports on the efficacy of 14-day bismuth-based quadruple therapy over that of 7day therapy as a second-line treatment for Hp eradication. The results indicate that14 day quadruple therapy showed significantly higher rate of Hp eradication, and no adverse effects. This study deals with apparent increased in resistance to Hp eradication by a standard triple therapy among of Korean population, and provides only limited new insights into approaches to Hp eradication regimens. Abstract, line 2 “corresponding 3-day triple therapy”, should read “corresponding 7-day quadruple “ ?? Discussion, p.11. The section on ulcer-healing properties of bismuth preparations should add more pertinent references, i.e., Am. J. Gastroenterol. 85(1990) 390-393; Eur. J. Pharmacol. 184(1990) 55-63.



**ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 16158

**Title:** Efficacy of 14 versus 7 days of bismuth-based quadruple therapy as second-line eradication treatment of Helicobacter pylori infection in Korea

**Reviewer’s code:** 00503406

**Reviewer’s country:** Hungary

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2015-01-01 12:27

**Date reviewed:** 2015-01-12 19:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This is a retrospective study including a high number of patients examined between 2004 and 2011. The design of study is adequate, the methodology used for Helicobacter pylori diagnosis is correct and conform with the international guidelines.

I have the following concerns:

- were the cases in- or outpatients?
- if the study was retrospective, how was the compliance and the incidence of side-effect recorded? (diary? questionnaire? other? - these must be stated in the manuscript)
- the eradication rates were rather poor on ITT bases; only PMBT-14 days regimens achieved 84% on PP basis - so, this can not be qualified as good results.
- PMID and doi numbers are lacking from the reference list.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 16158

**Title:** Efficacy of 14 versus 7 days of bismuth-based quadruple therapy as second-line eradication treatment of Helicobacter pylori infection in Korea

**Reviewer's code:** 00227386

**Reviewer's country:** United Kingdom

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2015-01-01 12:27

**Date reviewed:** 2015-01-13 20:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an excellent paper and only needs minor corrections before being considered for publication. There are two typographical errors in the Abstract:- 1)In the 2nd. line "triple " should read "quadruple". 2) In the 7th. line "for either 14" should read "or for either 14".

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 16158

**Title:** Efficacy of 14 versus 7 days of bismuth-based quadruple therapy as second-line eradication treatment of Helicobacter pylori infection in Korea

**Reviewer's code:** 00009415

**Reviewer's country:** Greece

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2015-01-01 12:27

**Date reviewed:** 2015-01-20 16:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study the authors investigated the efficacies of 14 vs 7 days of bismuth-based quadruple therapies as second-line eradication treatments of Helicobacter pylori infection in Korea and concluded that the 14-day therapy is a significantly more effective as compared with the 7-day alternative. COMMENTS 1. The study is retrospective, but this is not clear in the abstract, method section. I would suggest the following change: Between 2004 and 2014, the medical records of 790 patients who had experienced failure of first-line proton pump inhibitor (PPI)-based eradication therapy and then treated with bismuth-based quadruple therapy were retrospectively reviewed. 2. In the abstract BPMT should be written in full when first met in the text. 3. In page 8 (first para, last lines) and page 10 (first para, last lines) and in figure 2 the authors comment that "The eradication rates between 2004-2009 and 2010-2014 periods were significantly higher in the PBMT-14 group than those in the PBMT-7 according to both the ITT and the PP analysis (p < 0.05)." It should be interesting to know whether there were any differences in the eradication rates for either the 14-day or the 7-day therapies between the two time periods.