

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16027

Title: Targeting the clusterin gene in the treatment of hepatocellular carcinoma: a novel target in regulating apoptosis and drug resistance

Reviewer's code: 03119023

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-12-23 12:15

Date reviewed: 2015-01-25 21:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review, the authors summarized the developments of clusterin research on HCC, they described the structure, function and related signaling pathways of clusterin, and listed several relevant clinical trials, then gave some suggestions for future studies. Generally, it was well written, and provided useful information for researchers in this area. Major Comments are listed below:

- 1.The title was 'Targeting the clusterin gene in the treatment of hepatocellular carcinoma...' , however, the authors wasted too many words in discussing other cancers, such as prostate cancer, lung cancer and breast cancer. It seems to be a little off-topic.
- 2.Up to now, the number of original studies on clusterin in HCC is still limited, maybe it is too early to make a review now. In fact, there are several quite good reviews in clusterin research(Tomas, OncoTargets and Therapy 2014;7 447-456, and Rizzi, F, et.al, Endocr Relat Cancer. 2010 29.17(1):R1-17).
- 3.Have the authors checked clinicaltrials.gov to see if there are any current clinical trials in this area? It is worth mentioning if there are.
- 4.There are several grammatical and typographical errors in the manuscript. Careful revision by a native English speaker with experience in scientific writing is suggested

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16027

Title: Targeting the clusterin gene in the treatment of hepatocellular carcinoma: a novel target in regulating apoptosis and drug resistance

Reviewer's code: 02539405

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2014-12-23 12:15

Date reviewed: 2015-02-05 00:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Totally, article is fine. It shows us targeting the clusterin gene in the treatment of HCC which is a novel target in regulating apoptosis and drug resistance. It has newness, concision, and readability in each part. But it also has some flows which should be noticed or improved. Firstly, in the abstract, there are some written mistakes. Secondly, body text has clarified targeting the clusterin gene in the treatment of HCC and has given some figures and tables to support topic, however, it lacks of sufficient statistics conclusion to analyze the topic deeply. What's more, conclusions discussed the present problems and challenges which should be solved or improved. If the authors bring up more projects about further research in needed, it would be better.